

# 12

## Mahā Saccaka Sutta

The Greater Discourse to Saccaka | M 36.17-44/1:242-249<sup>1</sup>

Theme: The Bodhisattva's self-mortification

Translated by Piya Tan ©2003, rev 2010; for the full version, see **SD 49.4**

### The parable of the fire-sticks<sup>2</sup>

**17** “Then, Aggi,vessana, three similes, unheard before, spontaneously occurred to me.

Suppose, Aggi,vessana, there were a wet, [241] sappy piece of wood lying in water. Then, a man were to come along, carrying an upper piece of fire-stick, thinking:

‘I will make fire. I will produce heat.’”

What do you think, Aggi,vessana? Could that man make fire and produce heat by rubbing the fire-stick on this wet, sappy piece of wood lying in water?”

“No, master Gotama.”

“What is the cause of this? “

“Because, master Gotama, the wood is wet, sappy and lying in water. That man would only become weary and vexed.

Even so, Aggi,vessana, there are some recluses and brahmins who still do not live without bodily and mentally withdrawn from sense pleasures, and whose

desire for sense-pleasure,	<i>kāma-c, chanda</i>
affection for sense-pleasure,	<i>kāma, sneha</i>
infatuation with sense-pleasure,	<i>kāma, mucchā</i>
thirst for sense-pleasure and	<i>kāmapipāsā</i>
fever for sense-pleasure.	<i>kāma, parilāha</i>

*have not been fully abandoned nor suppressed internally.*

Even so, if those recluses and brahmins experienced painful, severe, acute and sharp pains due to striving they would not be able to gain knowledge, vision, and supreme awakening.

And even if those recluses and brahmins did not experience painful, severe, acute and sharp pains due to striving, they would not be able to gain knowledge, vision, and supreme awakening. “

This, Aggi,vessana, was **the first simile** that occurred to me spontaneously, unheard before.

**18** Then, Aggi,vessana, a second simile, unheard before, spontaneously occurred to me.

Suppose, Aggi,vessana, a wet, sappy piece of wood were placed on dry ground, far away from water. Then, a man were to come along, holding an upper piece of fire-stick, thinking,

‘I will make fire. I will produce heat.’

What do you think about his, Aggi,vessana? Could that man, holding an upper piece of fire-stick, and rubbing on that wet, sappy stick placed on the dry ground, far away from water, light a fire? Could he produce heat?”

<sup>1</sup> For a complete tr, see SD 49.4.

<sup>2</sup> On the location of the account of the parable of the fire-sticks, see M:ÑB 1229 n387. According to Bronkhorst, this episode of the 3 similes (M 36.17-19) and the episode where Saccaka contrasts the composed behaviour of the Buddha with the evasive reactions of the 6 heterodox teachers (M 36.48): “If we remove these portions...we are left with what may be called the ‘Original Mahāsaccaka Sūtra.’ From the beginning this Original Mahāsaccaka Sūtra must have contained the episode on meditation without breath and reduced intake of food. This episode itself may or may not have existed before the composition of the Original Mahāsaccaka Sūtra.” (1993:18). For a negative application of this parable, see **Kāya,gata,sati S** (M 119,22/ 3:94 @ SD 12.21).

“No, master Gotama.”

“What is the reason for this?”

“Because, master Gotama, the wood is wet and sappy although it had been placed on dry ground, far away from water. That man would only become weary and vexed.

Even so, Aggi,vessana, there are some recluses and brahmins who still do not live without being bodily and mentally withdrawn from sense-pleasure, and whose desire for sense-pleasure, affection for sense-pleasure, infatuation with sense-pleasure, thirst for sense-pleasure and fever for sense-pleasure have not been fully abandoned or suppressed internally.

Even if those recluses and brahmins experienced painful, severe, acute and sharp pains due to striving, they would not be able to gain knowledge, vision and supreme awakening.

And even if those recluses and brahmins did not experience painful, severe, acute and sharp pains due to striving, they would not be able to gain knowledge, vision and supreme awakening. “

This, Aggi,vessana, was **the second simile** that occurred to me spontaneously, unheard before.

**19** Then, Aggi,vessana, a third simile, unheard before, spontaneously occurred to me.

Suppose, Aggi,vessana, a dry, sapless stick were placed on the dry ground, far away from water. Then a man were to come along holding an upper piece of fire-stick, thinking,

‘I will make fire. I will produce heat.’

What do you think, Aggi,vessana? Could that man, holding an upper piece of fire-stick, and rubbing on that dry sapless stick placed on dry ground, far away from water, light a fire? Could he produce heat?

“Yes, master Gotama”

“What is the reason for this?”

“Because, master Gotama, that piece of wood was dry, sapless and was placed on dry ground far away from water.

“Even so, Aggi,vessana, there are some recluses and brahmins who live *bodily and mentally withdrawn from sense pleasures*, and whose desire for sense-pleasure, affection for sense-pleasure, infatuation with sense-pleasure, thirst for sense-pleasure and fever for sense-pleasure *have been fully abandoned and suppressed internally*.

If those recluses and brahmins experienced painful, severe, acute and sharp pains due to striving, they would be able to gain knowledge, vision and supreme awakening.

And even if those recluses and brahmins did not experience painful, severe, acute and sharp pains due to striving, they would be able to gain knowledge, vision and supreme awakening.

This, Aggi,vessana, was **the third simile** that occurred to me spontaneously, unheard before.

These, Aggi,vessana, were the 3 similes that occurred to me spontaneously, unheard before.

### The Bodhisattva’s self-mortification<sup>3</sup>

**20** I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘Suppose, with my teeth clenched and my tongue pressed against my palate, I beat down the mind with mind.’

So, Aggi,vessana, I with my teeth clenched and my tongue pressed against my palate, I beat down the mind with mind.

20.2 While I, Aggi,vessana, was subduing, restraining and beating down my mind, with teeth clenched and my tongue pressed against my palate, *sweat poured from my armpits*.

<sup>3</sup> The best known image of the mortifying Buddha is that from Sikri (2<sup>nd</sup> cent CE), now in the Lahore Museum, Pakistan: see [http://www.azibaza.com/lecture/lectures\\_emaciated.htm](http://www.azibaza.com/lecture/lectures_emaciated.htm).

20.3 Just like as a strong man, Aggi,vessana holding a weaker man by the head or by the shoulders, were to restrain, subdue, attack him,

20.4 even so, when I, Aggi,vessana, with my teeth clenched, and my tongue pressed against my palate, sweat poured from my armpits.

20.5 But although tireless energy was aroused in me, and undistracted mindfulness was established, my body was overstrained [243] and ill at ease because I was exhausted by the painful striving.

20.6 But such painful feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.<sup>4</sup>

21 I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘Suppose I practise the breathingless meditation.’<sup>5</sup> So I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths *through my mouth and nose*.

While I did so, there was *a loud sound of winds coming out from my ear-holes*, just like a loud sound of winds from a smith’s bellows.

Even so, Aggi,vessana, when I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths, there was a loud sound of winds coming out from my ear-holes.

But although tireless energy was aroused in me, and undistracted mindfulness was established, my body was overstrained and ill at ease because I was exhausted by the painful striving.

But such painful feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

22 I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘Suppose I practise *further* the breathingless meditation.’

So I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths through my mouth, nose and ears.

While I did so, *violent winds cut through my head*, just as if a strong man were splitting my head open with a sharp sword.

Even so, Aggi,vessana, when I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths, there was a loud sound of winds coming out from my ear-holes.

But although tireless energy was aroused in me, and undistracted mindfulness was established, my body was overstrained and ill at ease because I was exhausted by the painful striving.

But such painful feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

23 I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘Suppose I practise *further* the breathingless meditation.’

So I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths through my mouth, nose and ears.

While I did so, there were *violent pains in my head*, just as if a strong man [244] were tightening a tough leather strap around my head as a headband.

Even so, Aggi,vessana, when I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths, there were violent pains in my head.

But although tireless energy was aroused in me, and undistracted mindfulness was established, my body was overstrained and ill at ease because I was exhausted by the painful striving.

But such painful feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

24 I thought thus, Aggi,vessana, ‘Suppose I practise *further* the breathingless meditation.’ So I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths through my mouth, nose and ears.

While I did so, *violent winds carved up my belly*,<sup>6</sup> just as if a skilled butcher or his apprentice were to carve up an ox’s belly with a sharp butcher’s knife.

<sup>4</sup> This is apparently the earliest canonical example of the 2 kinds of pain (bodily and mental), wherein the saint experiences only bodily pain but not mental pain: see **Sall’atthēna S** (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5.

<sup>5</sup> “Breathingless meditation,” *appānaka jhāna*.

<sup>6</sup> According to Agniveśa’s *Caraka Saṁhitā*, Sūtra,sthāna 20.11 (p113), headache (*śīroruc*) [§§21-23] and belly (*udarāveṣṭaḥ* [§24]: the Ayurvedic commentator Cakrapānidatta explains: *udarasyāveṣṭanam ivodarāveṣṭaḥ*) are

Even so, Aggi,vessana, when I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths, violent winds carved up my belly.

But although tireless energy was aroused in me, and undistracted mindfulness was established, my body was overstrained and ill at ease because I was exhausted by the painful striving.

But such painful feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

**25** I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘Suppose I practise *further* the breathingless meditation.’

So I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths through my mouth, nose and ears.

While I did so, there was *a violent burning in my body*, just as if two men were to seize a weaker man by both arms, might set him on fire and roast him over a pit of burning coal.

Even so, Aggi,vessana, when I stopped my in-breaths and out-breaths through my mouth, nose and ears, there was a violent burning in my body.

But although tireless energy was aroused in me, and undistracted mindfulness was established, my body was overstrained and ill at ease because I was exhausted by the painful striving.

But such painful feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

**26** Now, Aggi,vessana, when **[245]** the devas saw me, some said: ‘The recluse Gotama is dead!’

Other devas said: ‘The recluse Gotama is not dead but dying!’

Still others said: ‘The recluse Gotama is neither dead nor dying: he is an arhat, for such is how arhats live!’<sup>7</sup>

**27** I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘Suppose I practise cutting off food entirely.’ Then, Aggi,vessana, devas came to me and said,

‘Good sir, do not do so. If you do so, we shall infuse divine essence<sup>8</sup> through the pores of your skin and you will live on like that.’

I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘Suppose I practise cutting off food entirely, and these devas were to infuse divine essence through the pores of my skin, and I live on that, then I shall be lying.’ So, Aggi,vessana, I dismissed the devas, saying, ‘There is no need!’

**28** I thought thus,

‘Suppose I take very little food, a handful each time, perhaps of bean soup or lentil soup or vetch<sup>9</sup> soup or pea soup.’

So, Aggi,vessana, I took food little by little, drop by drop, such as bean soup or lentil soup or vetch soup or pea soup. When I did so, my body reached a state of extreme emaciation.

Because of eating so little,

my limbs became like the joints of vine stems or bamboo stems;

my backside became like a buffalo’s [camel’s] hoof;<sup>10</sup>

the projections of my spine stood out like corded beads;

my ribs jutted out like the crazy<sup>11</sup> rafters of an old broken shed;

caused by wind (*vāta*). Heat (*dāha*), on the other hand, is caused by bile (*pitta*): see Sūtra,sthāna 20.14 (p114). See Bronkhorst 1993:20 f & n29.

<sup>7</sup> I B Horner is puzzled by this statement and speculates that either these devas are mistaken or they are using the word *arhat* in a pre-Buddhist sense (M:H 1:299 n1). John Strong, in *The Legend and Cult of Upagupta*, adds, “It is nonetheless interesting to take their statements at face value: an arhat, think the deities, is someone who paradoxically looks both dead and alive at the same time.” (1992:88)

<sup>8</sup> “Divine essence,” *oja*, ambrosia.

<sup>9</sup> A beanlike climbing plant.

<sup>10</sup> *Oṭṭha,paḍaṃ*, often tr as “camel’s hoof,” but as noted by LS Cousins, it is prob “buffalo” in Vedic rather than “camel” in Classical Skt (1997: 268 f); see CPD: <sup>2</sup>*oṭṭha*.

the gleam of my eyes sank deep down into their sockets,  
 looking like the gleam of water gone far down in a deep well;  
 my scalp shrivelled and withered  
 like [246] green bitter gourd shrivels and withers in the wind and sun;  
 When, Aggi,vessana, I thought: ‘I will touch the skin of my belly,’  
 it was my backbone that I took hold of.  
 When I thought: ‘I will touch my backbone,’ it was the skin of my belly that I took hold of.  
 Because I ate so little, the skin of my belly, Aggi,vessana, came to be cleaving to my backbone.  
 When, Aggi,vessana, I defaecated or urinated, I fell over on my face right there;  
 When, Aggi,vessana, I tried to ease my body by rubbing my limbs with my hands,  
 the hair, rotted at their roots, fell off from my body as I rubbed—all because of eating so little.<sup>12</sup>  
**29** Indeed, Aggi,vessana, when people saw me, some said, ‘The recluse Gotama is black.’  
 Others said, ‘The recluse Gotama is not black, he is brown.’  
 Others said, ‘The recluse Gotama is neither; he is golden-skinned.’  
 So much had the clear, bright colour of my skin deteriorated through eating so little.’  
**30** I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,  
 ‘In *the past*, whatever recluses and brahmins have experienced painful, racking, piercing pains due  
 to striving, this is the utmost extreme, there is none beyond this.  
 In the future, whatever recluses and brahmins will experience painful, racking, piercing pains due to  
 striving, this is the utmost extreme, there is none beyond this.  
 At present, whatever recluses and brahmins are experiencing painful, racking, piercing pains due to  
 striving, this is the utmost extreme, there is none beyond this.  
 But by these painful austerities, I did not attain any superhuman state, nor any distinction in know-  
 ledge and vision worthy of the noble ones. Could there be another path to awakening?’

## The middle way

**31** Then, Aggi,vessana, I thought thus, ‘I recall<sup>13</sup> that when my father the Sakya was occupied while  
 I was sitting in the cool shade of a rose-apple tree, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from  
 unwholesome states, I entered upon and abided in the first dhyana that is accompanied by initial appli-  
 cation and sustained application, zest and joy born of seclusion.  
 Could that be the path to awakening?’  
 Then following on that memory, Aggi,vessana, I realized, ‘That *is* the path to awakening!’  
**32** I thought thus, ‘Why [247] do I fear the pleasure that has nothing to do with sensual pleasures  
 and unwholesome states?’

<sup>11</sup> *Jarā,sālāya gopanasīyo olugga,viluggā bhavanti*. Here, *olugga,vilugga* means “collapsing and fallen down, broken-down, dilapidated” (not “crazy” as in M:H & M:ÑB): see CPD: & DP: *olujjati*. See LS Cousins 1997: 269.

<sup>12</sup> The Bodhisattva’s self-mortification. There are at least three well known statues of the Buddha looking very emaciated. In his paper “The Emaciated Gandhāran Buddha Images: Asceticism, Health and the Body,” Robert L. Brown argues that although most people think that these images depict the Bodhisattva at the height of his self-mortification, on closer examination of the details on these images, they actually represent the Buddha fasting during the 49 days following the great awakening (Brown 1997:106, 112). Brown, however, fails to note perhaps the clearest evidence that it is the Buddha, not the Bodhisattva, who is represented in the Sikri and the Jamalgarhi images (and very likely in the Takht-i-Bahi image, too)—namely, the presence of the halo or aureole behind the image’s head—which Brown acknowledges in a personal communication in 2002.

<sup>13</sup> The ploughing festival, ie, the ritual sowing (*vappa,maṅgala*), when he practises the mindfulness of the breath (MA 2:290 f; J 1:57). On this first dhyana episode (M 26,31 f/1:246 f), cf Chinese version, T1428.781a4-11.

I thought thus, ‘I do not fear the pleasure that has nothing to do with sensual pleasures and unwholesome states!’<sup>14</sup>

**33** I thought thus, Aggi,vessana,

‘It is not easy to attain that pleasure with a body so excessively emaciated. Suppose I ate some solid food—some boiled rice and gruel.’<sup>15</sup>

And so, Aggi,vessana, I ate some solid food, boiled rice and gruel.

Now at that time, Aggi,vessana, the 5 monks were waiting upon me, thinking, ‘If our recluse Gotama achieve some higher state, he will inform us.’

But when I ate the boiled rice and gruel, the 5 monks were disgusted and left me, thinking, ‘The recluse Gotama now lives luxuriously. He has given up the quest and reverted to luxury!’

## The attainment of dhyana

**34** Now when I had eaten solid food and regained my strength, then quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, I entered and remained in **the first dhyana**, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, accompanied by zest and joy born of seclusion.

But such pleasant feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

**35** With the stilling of initial application and sustained application, by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind, he enters and remains in **the second dhyana**, free of initial application and sustained application,<sup>16</sup> accompanied by zest and happiness born of concentration. He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with zest and happiness born of concentration.

But such pleasant feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

**36** And with the fading away of zest, I remained equanimous, mindful and fully aware, and experienced happiness with the body. I entered and remained in **the third dhyana**, of which the Noble Ones declare, ‘Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.’ He permeates and pervades, floods and fills this very body with the happiness (of body), free of zest (of mind).

But such pleasant feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

**37** And with the abandoning of joy and pain—and with the earlier disappearance of joy and grief—I entered and remained in **the fourth dhyana**, that is neither pleasant nor painful and contains mindfulness fully purified by equanimity. I sat, pervading the body with a pure, bright mind, so that there is no part of my entire body that is not pervaded by a pure, bright mind.

<sup>14</sup> See SD 32.2 (1.2.2.3). On the 2 kinds of pleasures—sensual pleasure and the pleasure of awakening—see **Arāṇa,vibhaṅga S** (M 139,9/3:233), SD 7.8. On pleasure experienced by the awakened mind, see **(Kosambī) Uṇṇābha S** (S 51.15), SD 10.10.

<sup>15</sup> “Boiled rice and gruel,” *odāna,kummāsa* (as *dvandva*), or “rice gruel” (as *tatpurusha*). *Senāni,gama*. This is the original name as found in the Canon (eg V 1:21; M 1:166. 240; A 1:106). **(Māra) Pāsa S 2** (4.5) says that this is at *Senāni,gāma* (M 4.5/1:105 f; V 1:21; Mvst 3:315 f). The Comys give it as *Senāni,nigama*, the market town of *Senāni*, on the *Nerañjarā* bank near *Uruvelā* (MA 2:173), and where *Sujātā* gives milk-rice (*pāyāsa*) to the *Bodhisattva*, which is his last meal before the awakening (J 1:68; SA 1:172; AA 1:401; BA 7; ApA 72; DhsA 34). The **Lalita,vistāra** calls it *Senāpati,grāma* (Lalv 311.248). The Sutta here only mentions the humble *odāna,kummāsa*, which is prob a part of *Sujātā*’s offering, as noted by the Comys.

<sup>16</sup> The 2<sup>nd</sup> dhyana is known as “the noble silence” (*ariya,tuñhī,bhāva*) because within it initial application and sustained application (thought and discursion, *vitakka,vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf. S 4:293 where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī,sañkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech. In **Ariya,pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to “either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence” (ie either talk Dharma or meditate).

But such pleasant feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.<sup>17</sup>

### The great awakening

**38** (1) When my concentrated mind was thus purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, wieldy, steady and attained to unshakable steadiness, **[248]** I directed it to **the knowledge of the recollection of past lives**. I recollected my manifold past lives, that is, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five [as in M 4.27]...Thus in their forms and details I recollected my manifold past lives.

**39** This, Aggi,vessana, was the first true knowledge won by me in the first watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and true knowledge arose, darkness was banished and light arose, as happens in one who abides diligent, ardent and resolute. But such pleasant feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

**40** (2) When my concentrated mind was thus purified, bright, unblemished, rid of imperfection, malleable, wieldy, steady and attained to unshakable steadiness, I directed it to **the knowledge of the passing away and reappearance of beings**...[as in M 4.29]<sup>18</sup> ... Thus with divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I saw beings passing away and reappearing; I comprehend that beings are inferior and superior, fair and ugly, gone to a happy state, gone to a suffering state, faring according to their karma; thus I understood how beings fared on according to their karma...

**41** This, Aggi,vessana, was the second true knowledge won by me in the middle watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and true knowledge arose, **[249]** darkness was banished and light arose, as happens in one who abides diligent, ardent and resolute. But such pleasant feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

**42** (3) When my concentrated mind was thus purified...attained to unshakable steadiness, I directed it to **the knowledge of the destruction of the influxes**.<sup>19</sup> I directly knew as it really is:

---

<sup>17</sup> Norman: "It is debatable whether the Buddha actually went through the four states of meditation as set out in the texts. It seems more likely that there was a single developing state of meditation, which (when he came to describe it to his followers) could conveniently be broken down into four states. ...the Buddha was trying to put into words something ineffable which had happened to him, and his words are really a later rationalization (perhaps of his followers) of the irrational. All his views are simple ways of describing different aspects of the same experience, and are complementary, not contradictory. These various rationalizations are not necessarily of different dates, since they may be products of different environments and (preaching) needs." (1990:128 n5).

<sup>18</sup> The full reading is found at SD 49.4.

<sup>19</sup> *Āsava-k, khaya, ñāṇa*. The term *āsava* (lit "in-and-out-flow") has been variously translated as taints, corruptions, cankers, intoxicants, biases, depravity, misery, evil (influence), or simply left untranslated. The Abhidhamma lists four *āsava*: the influx of (1) sense-desire (*kām'āsava*), (2) (desire for eternal) existence (*bhav'āsava*), (3) wrong views (*diṭṭh'āsava*), (4) ignorance (*avijjāsava*) (D 16.2.4, Pm 1.442, 561, Dhs §§1096-1100, Vbh §937). These 4 are also known as "floods" (*ogha*) and "yokes" (*yoga*). *The influx of existence* is the attachment and desire for the realm of form and of formlessness, and as such, is the craving for the dhyanas, on account of *the false views* of eternalism and annihilationism. As such, *the influx of view* is subsumed under the influx of existence (MA 1:67). The list of 3 influxes (omitting the influx of views) is probably older and is found more freq in the suttas (D 3:216, 33.1.10(20); M 1:55, 3:41; A 3.59, 67, 6.63). See BDict under *āsava*.

‘This is suffering;  
 This is the arising of suffering;  
 This is the ending of suffering;  
 This is the path to the ending of suffering.’<sup>20</sup>

These are the influxes;  
 This is the arising of the influxes;  
 This is the ending of the influxes;  
 This is the path to the ending of the influxes.’<sup>21</sup>

- 43** When I knew and saw thus, my mind was liberated  
 from the influx of sensual desire,  
 from the influx of existence, and  
 from the influx of ignorance.

When it was liberated, there arose the knowledge: ‘It is liberated!’ I directly knew: ‘Destroyed is birth. The holy life has been lived. What needs to be done has been done. There is (for me) no more of arising in any state of being.’

**44** This, Aggi,vessana, was the third true knowledge won by me in the third watch of the night. Ignorance was banished and true knowledge arose, darkness was banished and light arose, as happens in one who abides diligent, ardent and resolute. But such pleasant feeling that arose in me did not invade my mind and remain.

— evaṃ —

---

<sup>20</sup> These 4 statements on suffering pose an interesting problem: they are not called noble truths here (and in Sāmañña,phala S, 2.97). Norman remarks that “since they appear to be subordinate to the four statements about the *āsavas*, it is possible that the statements about misery are a later addition, which led to a parallel, but inappropriate, set of four statements being evolved about the *āsavas*, to provide a symmetry. See Schmithausen 1981:205 & Norman 1982: 377-91, 1990:130.

<sup>21</sup> As in **Sāmaññaphala S** (D 2.97/1:83 f) = SD 8.10. On the application of the 4 noble truth template to both *dukkha* and to *āsava* here, see Analayo 2003:224 n28 + SD 17.4(8.4).

## Bibliography on the Life of the Buddha

[See Frank E. Reynolds, *Guide to the Buddhist Religion*, 1981 ch 8]

### (A) Canonical biography of the Buddha

Bronkhorst, Johannes

- 1993 *Two Traditions of Meditation in Ancient India*. [Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag Wiesbaden, 1986. xii 145pp 24 cm] 2<sup>nd</sup> ed Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1993. xviii 153pp hb incl pagination of 1<sup>st</sup> ed.

Ling, Trevor O

- 1973 *The Buddha*. London: Temple Smith, 1973. A sociological survey of the Buddha and Indian Buddhism.

Ñanamoli, Bhikkhu

- 1992 *The Life of the Buddha* [1972]. Kandy, Sri Lanka: Buddhist Publication Society, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed 1992. Life and teachings of the Buddha selected from Pali sources. One of the best books to use as a “first reader” for Pali Buddhism.

Norman, K R

- 1982 “The four noble truths: a problem of Pāli syntax.” In *Indological and Buddhist Studies (Festschrift for J W de Jong*. Canberra, 1982: 377-391.
- 1990 “Aspects of Early Buddhism.” In Edd David Seyfort Ruegg & Lambert Schmithausen, *Earliest Buddhism and Madhyamaka*, Leiden: EJ Brill, 1990:24-35.] In K R Norman, *Collected Papers* vol 4, Oxford: Pali Text Society, 1993: 124-138.
- 1995 “Mistaken Ideas about *Nibbāna*.” In *The Buddhist Forum*, vol 3, 1991-93 ed Tadeusz Skorupski & Ulrich Pagel, Univ of London: School of Oriental and African Studies, 1995: 211-225.

Schmithausen, Lambert

- 1981 “Liberating insight and meditation in early Buddhism.” In *Studien zum Jainismus und Buddhismus (Gedenkschrift für Ludwig Alsdorf)*, Hamburg, 1981.

Thomas, E J

- 1949 *The Life of the Buddha as Legend and History* [1927]. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed 1949. Readable, scholarly classic.

Vetter, T

- 1985 “The most ancient form of Buddhism.” In *Festschrift for Dr. Shozen Kumoi*, Kyoto, 1985: 70.

Walters, Jonathan S

- 1993 “Suttas as History: Four approaches to the *Sermon on the Noble Quest* (Ariyapariyesanasutta).” *History of Religions* 38,3 1993: 247-284. Walters claims that this sutta contains “arguably the oldest Buddha biography in existence.” (283).

### (B) General biography of the Buddha

Bareau, Andre

- 1963 *Recherches sur la biographie du bouddha*. Paris: Adrien-Maisonneuve, 1963. Exhaustive comparative study of the Pali sources, aimed at disproving Frauwallner's thesis (below) about the original biography of the Buddha.

Beyer, S

- [date] *Experience*, contains a lively translation from Cantos 13 and 14 of Asvaghosa's *Buddhacarita* (Acts of the Buddha), on the Awakening, [date]: 186-197.

Brown, Robert L

- 1997 “The Emaciated Gandhāran Buddha Images: Asceticism, Health and the Body.” In *Living a Life in Accord with Dhamma*, edd. Eilenberg et al. 1997: 105-115.

Conze, Edward

- 1959 *Buddhist Scriptures*. Baltimore: Penguin, 1959. Gives a condensed translation of the *Buddhacarita*, 1959: 34-66.

Cousins, Lance Selwyn

- 1997 Review of Ñāṇamoli & Bodhi (trs), *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha* (1995), *Journal of Buddhist Ethics* 4, 1997: 260-280. <http://www.buddhistethics.org/4/cous1.pdf>
- Cummings, Mary  
1982 *The Lives of the Buddha in the Art and Literature of Asia*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan, Center for South and Southeast Asian Studies, 1982.
- Foucher, Alfred [Charles Auguste]  
1949 *La vie du Bouddha d'après les textes et les monuments de l'Inde*. [The life of the Buddha after the texts and monuments of India.] Paris: Payot. [Abr tr Simone Brangier Boas, *The Life of Buddha According to the Ancient texts and Monuments of India*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan UP, 1963; repr New Delhi: Manoharlal, 2003. 272 pp.] The author expresses many questionable opinions on Buddhist doctrine; cf reviews: E. Lamotte, *Musèon* 62 1949:251-60 & R. Fazy, *Études Asiatiques/Asiatische Studien*, 1949:124-43.
- Frauwallner, E  
1956 *The Earliest Vinaya and the Beginnings of Buddhist Literature*. Rome: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente, 1956. Advances the thesis that there was originally a full biography of the Buddha that was then lost except for fragments preserved in the early canons.
- Johnston, E H  
1984 (tr) *The Buddhacarita, Or, Acts of the Buddha*. 3d ed. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1984. The best complete translation, with an excellent intro.
- Karetsky, Patricia Eichenbaum  
1992 *The Life of the Buddha: Ancient Scriptural and Pictorial Traditions*. Lanham: University Press of America, 1992.
- Lamotte, Etienne (1903-1983)  
1988a *The History of Indian Buddhism: from the origins to the aka era* [1958]. Tr Sara Webb-Boin under the supervision of Jean Dantinne. Publications de l'Institut Orientaliste de Louvain 36. Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste de Université Catholique de Louvain. Louvain-Paris: Peeters Press, 1988. An academically authoritative reference work that is a good source of Buddhist Sanskrit terminology.
- Nakamura, Hajime  
1977 *Gotama Buddha*. Los Angeles: Buddhist Books International, 1977. A short, scholarly retelling of the life.  
1980 *Indian Buddhism: a Survey with Bibliographical Notes*. [Inter-cultural Research Institute Monograph 9] Hirakata City (Osaka): Kansai U of Foreign Studies. Tokyo, 1980: 16-21. Repr Buddhist Tradition Series 1, Delhi: MLBD 1987. viii 324 pp hb.
- Narada Thera  
1988 *The Buddha and His Teachings*. Kandy, Sri Lanka: Buddhist Publication Society, 1988 (repr).
- Reynolds Frank E; & Charles Hallisey  
1976 "The Many Lives of Buddha: A Study of Sacred Biography and Theravada Tradition," in Reynolds, Frank E, and Donald Capps, eds, *The Biographical Process*. The Hague: 1976.  
1989 "The Buddha," in Kitagawa and Cummings, *Buddhism and Asian History*, 1989:29-49. Surveys the concept of "Buddha" in all its forms.
- Warren, HC  
1896 (tr) *Buddhism in Translations*. Harvard Oriental Series 3. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1896: 38-83, 331-349. 8 issues. 7<sup>th</sup> issue 1922. Repr Atheneum, 1972.
- Wickremesinghe, K D P  
1972 *The Biography of the Buddha*. Colombo. 344 pp. Annotated narrative based on both Pali & Sanskrit sources; ch 45 on sources of Buddha's life. Similar in style of Ñāṇamoli's *The Life of the Buddha* but which uses solely Pali sources.

100614 110817a 120703 141123 180616 180630