

8

Sallekha Sutta

The Discourse on Self-effacement | M 8

Theme: Self-effacement and its true purpose

Translated & annotated by Piya Tan ©2008, 2017

1 Sutta significance1.1 SUTTA SUMMARY and highlights1.1.1 Sutta summary

1.1.1.1 The Sallekha Sutta (M 8) records teaching given by the Buddha to Mahā Cunda [4] on the true purpose of the spiritual life as that of **self-effacement** (*sallekha*) [2.1], which refers to

- (1) the uprooting of views, especially self-views and world-views, and
- (2) self-effort—through meditation and mindfulness—in completely removing our mental defilements for the sake of awakening.

1.1.1.2 Here, we can take “**self-views**” (*sandiṭṭhi*) [§12.4(44)] as a shorthand for the 3 fetters (*saṃyojana*)—self-identity view, spiritual doubt and attachment to rituals and vows¹—the eradication of which results in streamwinning,² the very first real step on the noble eightfold path of awakening.³

The Commentary, in fact, explains the expression “**wherever they arise**” (*yattha uppajjanti*) [§3.2] as referring to the 5 aggregates (MA 1:182,22), and notes that “**seeing with right wisdom**” (*samma-p,paññā-ya passato*) [§3.3] as referring to the wisdom that is the basis of streamwinning (MA 1:183.16). [2.2.1]

1.1.1.3 The Commentary informs us that **Mahā Cunda** questions the Buddha here, specifically out of concern about some of his students, who have been overestimating themselves. They believe that they have transcended all the self-views and world-views, when they have really not [4.3].

It is likely that there are other monks present in this important consultation that Mahā Cunda has with the Buddha. This is, in fact, explicitly mentioned at the conclusion of the Madhyama Āgama version of the Sutta (MĀ 91). [1.1.4]

Furthermore, the Sallekha Sutta closes with the Buddha’s exhortation to meditate, which is given in the plural: *Jhāyatha cunda mā pamādattha, mā pacchā vippaṭisārino ahuvattha* [§18]. This shows that although the conclusion only explicitly mentions Mahā Cunda, it implies the presence of other monks.⁴

1.1.2 Sutta structure

The Sallekha Sutta is traditionally structured as a progressive teaching centering on meditation in response to a question asked by the elder Mahā Cunda. **The Sutta** is divided into 3 main parts: an introduction, the instructions (the main body of 5 sections), and a short but important conclusion, thus:

¹ On the 3 fetters, see **Emotional independence**, SD 40a.8.

² On streamwinning (*sotāpatti*), see **Entering the stream**, SD 3.3.

³ For a detailed study of the noble eight path, see SD 10.16.

⁴ This is, in fact, the case in other suttas where, even though a conclusion mentions only a certain person or group of person joyfully approving of the teaching, the approval—or at least the presence—of others is often implied.

Introduction

§§1-3 Mahā Cunda’s question.

§3.2 The Buddha’s preliminary reply: Do not own any thoughts.

§§4-11 The 8 attainments (*aṭṭha samāpatti*): the 4 form dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments.

The instructions

§12	<u>The 1st instruction.</u>	Self-effacement.	<i>sallekha</i>
§13	<u>The 2nd instruction.</u>	The arising of thoughts.	<i>citt’uppāda</i>
§14	<u>The 3rd instruction.</u>	Moving around and beyond.	<i>parikkamana</i>
§15	<u>The 4th instruction.</u>	The upward states.	<i>upari,bhāva</i>
§16	<u>The 5th instruction.</u>	The way to nirvana.	<i>parinibbāna</i>

Conclusion

§17 The closing summary on the instructions.

§18 The Buddha’s call to meditation.

§19 Closing exultation.

1.1.3 Highlights

1.1.3.1 The Sallekha Sutta—and its Chinese parallels [1.1.4]⁵—opens with Mahā Cunda asking the Buddha whether the predominant **views of the unawakened**—those connected with self-views or with world-views [§3]—are abandoned by the meditator right from the start [1.2]. Mahā Cunda’s concern is that some meditators are over-rating their meditation attainments, falsely thinking that they have attained sainthood when they have really not [1.2.2].

The Buddha answers that views arise, lie latent, and then assail the mind. Insight of their non-self nature should be applied into the very place where such views arise, that is, the 5 aggregates (MA 1:182,-22) [1.1.1.2]. As soon as they are noticed, such mental states should be “disowned,” that is, abandoned by reflecting on non-self [§3.2].

1.1.3.2 This process of view-relinquishment and self-healing do not occur with meditation alone. The form dhyanas are helpful *after the fact* as “pleasant states here and now” for the arhat, and the formless attainments work as “peaceful abidings” for him. Such deep meditations can and must be the bases for a calm and clear mind for the sake of “self-effacement” (*sallekha*) [§12; 2.1], that is, eradicating the mental impurities (*cittassa upakkilesa*) [3].

1.1.3.3 Self-effacement (*sallekha*) is then defined by the Buddha, that is, in terms of noting the prevalence of 44 kinds of mental impurities, and working to remove them [§12]. This is the “social ethics” aspect of the Sutta, that is more broadly discussed in **the Vatthūpama Sutta** (M 7) [1.3.1]. It serves to remind us that “self-effacement” is not about what others thinks, say or do, but about our own actions, especially our mind, that needs to be purified by self-effort. We should not concern ourself with the impurities of *others* as we should with those of our own self: this is called “**moral independence.**” [1.3.5]

1.1.3.4 The practice of *self-effacement* begins with the cultivating of right thoughts—**the arousing of thought** (*cittass’uppāda*) [§13]—and right effort towards *the 44 kinds of mental impurities* [3], representative of the unwholesome aspects of our mind rooted in the latent tendencies, our “unconscious.”⁶ This

⁵ For a comparative study, see Analayo, *A Comparative Study of the Majjhima-nikāya*, Taiwan, 2011:59-66.

⁶ See **The unconscious**, SD 17.8b; **Unconscious views**, SD 31.9.

is the basic application of “insight” (*vipassanā*) by a mind calmed and clarified by “calm” (*samatha*). But this is only the beginning of the whole process of mental purification for self-awakening.

1.1.3.5 While the 1st and 2nd instructions [1.1.2], that is, §§12-13, work to define and delimit the mental defilements whenever they arise, the next step is that of “**moving around and beyond**” (*parikkamana*) them [§14]. This entails accepting what they are and then “disowning” them [§3.2] and so abandoning them, freeing oneself at least temporarily from them and their effects. As long as we are not yet arhats—that is, fully awakened like the Buddha—we need to keep on doing this in an ever more refined manner.

1.1.3.6 As we diligently work on disowning the mental impurities, we are freeing ourselves of our worldly ballast and rising ever higher on the spiral path of mental purification. Then, we attain “the upward states” (*upari,bhāva*) [1.1.3.7], that is, superior or higher attainments, the path of noble sainthood [§15].

“**The downward states**” (*adho,bhāva*)⁷ refer to any state that do not conduce to spiritual growth, whether these are unwholesome human conditions or the lower realms,⁸ that are uncondusive to spiritual cultivation and growth. The world, as a whole, wherever or whenever it does not conduce to spiritual cultivation leading to the path of awakening, is said to be *the downward states*.

1.1.3.7 These “**upward states**” (*upari,bhāva*) [§15], then, refer to conditions that conduce to spiritual cultivation and development, that is, streamwinning and beyond—“**the way to nirvana**” (*parinibbāna*)⁹ [§16], that is, the full extinction of the fires of lust, hate and delusion fed by the mental impurities. We can assume that the *nibbāna* (extinction) of subtler defilements are only temporary, but *habitual*, for the saints, short of the arhats. Only as arhats have we attained the *parinibbāna* (full and irreversible extinction) of even the subtlest defilements, freeing us from suffering and rebirth.

1.1.3.8 The verb *bhavissāma* (1st person future plural), “we will be,” is the common keyword of §§12-13, the Sutta’s key passages. It comes from *bhavissati*, “to be, to cultivate, to make become,” rooted in VBHŪ, “to be.” It is often used to describe a spiritual state or condition, as here.¹⁰ The verb, *bhavissāma*, although future actually functions to give a sense of determination and aspiration: “I will cultivate,” “I will be ... ” and so on.

The 3rd person future plural, *bhavissanti*, has been translated as expressing probability: “Others may be (may have, etc) ... ” relating to some negative quality.¹¹ To highlight the fact that such negative states or conditions are unnatural and resulting from misreading ‘external’ realities, I have sometimes taken it as a “verb to have.”

Bhavissāma, on the other hand, expresses wholesome qualities, and I have, as a rule, rendered it as a “verb-to-be.” This expresses the result of our cultivation: we *become* the wholesome states. They are a natural and inseparable part of us preparing us for awakening.

1.1.3.9 We see three forms of the word *parinibbāna* in the Sallekha Sutta, all of them found in the same section [§16] on the necessity of self-awakening before we can really awaken others. The word *pari-*

⁷ *Adho,bhāva-*, “the being or state below or downwards” (Abh 1173; Sadd 1173), preferred reading. Humorous wordplay on *adho,bhāga-* (m) “the lower part” (of the body), the anus; ins *~ena nikkhamati* (J 6:110,13’; DhA 1:126,10, 148,14; abl *~ā nikkhamati* (M 1:423,10. 3:186,8; A 4:132,1. See CPD: adho-magga.

⁸ The lower realms are the subhuman states of the asura, the animal, the preta and the hell-being: SD 2.22 (1.7).

⁹ On *parinibbāna*, see SD 50.1 (2.1.1.7; 2.2); SD 50.13 (1.3.1.2).

¹⁰ On the special senses of *bhavissati*, see SD 36.13 (6).

¹¹ On *bhavissati* expressing probability, see A K Warder, *Introduction to Pali*, 1963, 1974:55.

nibbāna simply means “nirvana” [§16].¹² For one who is “awakened (to nirvana)” the passage uses the present participle and adjective *parinibbuta*, which means “(whose defilements are) extinguished, cooled, attained to nirvana.”¹³ [§16.2]

Then, there is the interesting and rare phrase “help another to attain nirvana,” which, in Pali, is causative future verb, *parinibbāpessati*, “will cause to attain nirvana,”¹⁴ which occurs only here in the Sutta [§16.2]. Although literally correct, it is semantically incorrect to translate *parinibbāpessati*, “will cause (another) to attain nirvana” because self-awakening can only occur by one’s own efforts.¹⁵

The related instrumental noun that follows—*parinibbānāya*—means “by which to extinguish it” or “the means of utter quenching” [§16.3], or more simply, “for attaining nirvana.” The Sallekha Sutta simply states that the wholesome opposite of the mental impurity is the “means of quenching” that impurity. When all these impurities have been quenched, we attain nirvana.

1.1.3.9 In concluding his instructions, the Buddha reminds us to **meditate** (*jhāyatha*), so that we have a mind that is effective in removing the mental defilements [§18]. Note that although it is only Mahā Cunda who speaks with the Buddha in the Sutta, this concluding exhortation uttered by the Buddha is in the plural: it addresses everyone present—and us, today.

This is what the spiritual training—being a Buddhist, monastic or lay—is really about. Mahā Cunda joyfully approves of the Buddha’s teaching, clearly because his question has been fully answered and he knows just what to do [§19].

1.1.4 The Sallekha Sutta in Chinese translations

1.1.4.1 The Sallekha Sutta has a parallel in the Madhyama Āgama (MĀ 91) and another parallel in the Ekōttarika Āgama (EĀ 47.9).¹⁶ MĀ 91 is entitled “the discourse on Cunda’s inquiry about views,” 周那問見經 *zhōunà wènjiàn jīng*. While M 8 locates the Sutta at Jeta’s grove at Sāvattihī, MĀ 91 gives it as Ghosit’-ārāma at Kosambi, and EĀ 47.9 locates it in the Squirrels’ Feeding Ground at Rājagaha.

1.1.4.2 While the Sallekha Sutta and MĀ 91, its main Chinese Madhyama Āgama version, agree with for the most part, there are some significant differences. MĀ 91 omits the wrong factors of the tenfold rightness [§12.3 etc]¹⁷ and section (44) on clinging to self-views.

The other Chinese version, the Ekōttarika Āgama (EĀ 47.9) differs from the Sallekha Sutta in significant ways, by presenting different speculative views and closing with a set of verses. The EĀ 47.9 views proceeds from the existence of the self to a standard set of views: that the world is eternal or finite, the identity of self and body, the destiny of the tathagata after death, followed by views on the world creator. It is possible that this Chinese version underwent translation or transmission errors, or both.

¹² *Parinibbāna* as meaning “the final passing away” is a late development, a connotation popularized by **Mahā-parinibbāna S** (D 16), SD 9: see SD 50.13 (1.3.1); SD 50.27 (2).

¹³ V 2:156; S 1:212; A 1:138.

¹⁴ M 1:45; Nm 32; Nc 269.

¹⁵ On *parinibbāna* and its key forms, see SD 50.1 (2.1.1.7; 2.2); SD 50.13 (1.3.1.2).

¹⁶ MĀ 91 (T1.573b-574b) and EA 47.9 (T2.784a-c).

¹⁷ See Analayo 2011:62 (Table 1.9).

1.2 MAHĀ CUNDA’S QUESTION

1.2.1 THE BACKGROUND OF THE QUESTION

The Sallekha Sutta starts off with the elder Mahā Cunda asking the Buddha this question:

“Bhante, various views arise in the world, that is, in connection with self-views or with world-views. Now, bhante, does the abandoning or relinquishing of these views occur in a monk at the very beginning when he is wisely attending (to his meditation training)?” [§3]

The Commentary explains the phrase “**in a monk at the very beginning when he is wisely attending**” (*adim eva manasikaroto*) [§3.1] as follows: “This refers to one who is at the beginning of his cultivation of insight (*vipassanā, bhāvanā*) and has not yet attained streamwinning,” when the fetter of self-identity view is uprooted (MA 1:182,9).

Here, it should be noted that “the cultivation of insight” [§3] is not a kind of meditation, but simply the directing of the mind to observing the impermanence and rise-and-fall of phenomena—in short, the perception of impermanence. The beginner’s insight extends from the “discernment of name-and-form” (*nāma.rūpa, pariccheda*) up to the “knowledge of rise-and-fall” (*udaya-b, baya, ñana*).¹⁸

1.2.2 OVERESTIMATION

According to the Commentary, the elder Cunda is wondering about those who overrate the levels of their attainments. They believe that their meditative practice has attained certain levels when it has really not. Such **over-estimation** (*abhimāna*) “does not arise in foolish common people (*bāla, puthujjana*) who are utterly engrossed in worldly life, nor does it arise in noble disciples (*ariya, sāvaka*).” A streamwinner, for example, does not over-rate himself as a once-returner, and so on.

The over-estimation of oneself only occurs in one who is actually practising meditation, and has temporarily suppressed the defilements by way of tranquillity or insight. Mahā Cunda, being an arhat, is not one who over-rates himself. In his question, he is playing a vicarious role, putting himself in the place of the over-estimator. They are probably those who over-rate themselves amongst his pupils, and, with his question, he hopes to convey to them the Buddha’s instructions. (MA 1:183)

1.3 RELATION TO VATTHŪPAMA SUTTA (M 7)

1.3.1 M 7: Social ethics

The Sallekha Sutta (M 8) teaching is closely connected with that of **the Vatthūpama Sutta (M 7)**,¹⁹ which precedes it in the Majjhima Nikāya. These two discourses complement each other in a significant way. **M 7** speaks of 16 mental defilements in terms of ethical and social conduct as impeding spiritual progress on the higher stages of the path of awakening.

The M 8 list includes 13 of the 16 impurities listed in M 7 (factors 3-14 and 16 in §3 of the Vatthūpama Sutta), but the Sallekha Sutta list goes beyond the social ethics of M 7, and encompasses the mental hindrances, the path-factors, and so on. The M 8 list gives special attention to the effacement or removal of wrong views through self-effort [§12(44)].

¹⁸ See Vism 18, 20, 21.

¹⁹ M 7/1:36-40 (SD 28.12).

1.3.2 M 8: Mental training and beyond

While the **Vatthûpama Sutta** (M 7) deals basically with ethical and social training, the Sallekha Sutta (M 8) complements it by at once starting with mental training: it lays out the practical *methods* of **self-effacement** [§12]. This is the keyword for spiritual training here—beginning with the arising of thoughts [§13], followed by the “avoidance” (“moving around and beyond”) of the defilements [§14]. These methods also apply to the removal of the 16 defilements listed in M 7.

M 8, in short, deals with the “self-effacement” (*sallekha*) of unwholesome states with its list of 44 mental defilements (*cittassa upakkilesa*). Furthermore, the M 8 list of defilements is the most comprehensive of such lists directly connected with practical meditation training in the suttas. [3]

1.3.3 Meditation methods

1.3.3.1 The Vatthûpama Sutta (M 7), however, does give more details about the higher stages of progress beyond the ethical and social training. It details two sets of meditation methods. They are those of the recollection (*anussati*) of the 3 jewels (*ratana-t, taya*)—the Buddha, the Dharma and the noble sangha (§§5.2-11)—and the cultivation of the 4 divine abodes (*brahma, vihāra*)—lovingkindness, compassion, gladness and equanimity (§§13-16). These instructions should be related to our study of the Sallekha Sutta at the appropriate point.

1.3.3.2 While the Vatthûpama Sutta [1.3.3.1] prescribes the recollections (*anussati*) on the 3 jewels and the cultivation of the divine abodes (*brahma, vihāra*) as our meditation practices,²⁰ **the Sallekha Sutta** (M 8) lays out the 8 attainments—the 4 form dhyanas and the 4 formless attainments—as the bases for the abandoning of the mental defilements [§§4-11]. These powerful meditations generate for us the profound joy, calm and clarity needed for the work of removing the defilements.

1.3.4 A study scheme for M 7 + M 8

The Vatthûpama Sutta (M 7) should be studied with **the Sallekha Sutta** (M 8) as a spiritual exercise. For this, we only need to study those sections in both Suttas on the mental impurities, and how to overcome them. Here is a suggested scheme of study:

(1) The mental impurities

- 1.1 Look at the 16 mental impurities (M 7,3).
- 1.2 Look at the 44 mental impurities (M 8,12), especially the last 24: defilements (21)-(44).
- 1.3 Compare the two lists, especially noting how the defilements overlap.
- 1.4 Carefully note how the defilements are presented in both Suttas (M 7 + 8).
- 1.5 Carefully study **M 7,11** on the arising of joy in meditation; apply this to the study.

(2) The meditation methods

- 2.1 Study the 3 recollections (the 3 jewels) (M 7,5-7) and the 4 divine abodes (M 7,13-16).
- 2.2 Study the M 8 section on “the arising of thoughts” (M 8,13).
- 2.3 Study the M 8 section on “moving around and beyond” (M 8,14).
- 2.4 Reflectively read out either the section on “the upward states” (M 8,15) or on “the way to nirvana” (M 8,16), or both.
- 2.5 Do your own meditation or reflection as appropriate, alone or as a group.

²⁰ See M 7 @ SD 28.12 (1.2.4).

1.3.5 Moral independence

1.3.5.1 We should neither over-rate our meditation attainments [1.2.2] nor **over-reach** to concern ourself with the purity and purification of others, when we are ourself not purified at all. In other words, we should clear our own mind of mental impurities before can even think of actually helping others do so. This means that the Buddha is taking a serious view of our being qualified and effective healers—that we should be healed before we can heal others. Otherwise, all our experiences and encounters should be taken as lessons and opportunities for learning about the truth of reality.

1.3.5.2 The parable of the cloth in the Vatthūpama Sutta (M 7) instructs us that a soiled cloth will not properly take dye and will be “poorly dyed and impure in colour.” A clean and bright cloth, on the other hand, will easily take dye so that it is “well dyed and pure in colour.”²¹ The lesson of the parable is that—just as a clean and bright cloth will take dye well and look beautiful for wearing and using—so, too, only when our mind is cleansed of all its impurities, can it be effectively free of suffering and to free others of suffering, or to teach them how to work on it.

1.3.5.3 In an important and useful way, we can see the 1st instruction [1.1.2]—that on **self-effacement** [§12]—is to allow nothing to distract us from our “self-effacing” or removal of mental defilements. To understand the significance of this initial instruction, we should see it in the light of the teaching on **restlessness** (*uddhacca*), or more specifically, “**Dharma restlessness**” (*dharm’uddhacca*).²² Simply, this refers to our concern that the Dharma should grow and prosper, that people should know and see the Dharma, or at least, not be ignorant or deluded about it, or work against it—a zealous concern for right spiritual views and states.

1.3.5.4 When we are overwhelmed with Dharma restlessness [1.3.5.3], we tend to be over-concerned with the conduct and misconduct of others, especially the defilements arising in connection with social conduct. We would then feel disappointed and dismayed when we notice that despite our selflessness, kindness, wisdom and so on, we do not find positive responses in the behaviour of others.

If we harp on such judgements and perceptions, we may end up feeling discouraged and disempowered, even to the extent of giving up our own moral life and standards, and not to advance ourself to attain higher states of mental cultivation. We may then relegate ourself to the role of a “disgruntled self-righteous moralist,” which is really a respectable cloak for a self-centred life. We are then limited by our own narrow and unrealistic moral views solely spurred by our social responses to the worldly realities that we perceive.

1.3.5.5 In other words, we only see the problems and complain about them, but are unable to really do anything wholesome about them. This is an unsafe blind alley in our spiritual path. We have allowed the problems and issues to define and limit us, instead of really working to gain the insight and energy to solve, or at least, avoid, such negative conditions.

To get out of such a blind alley, we must cultivate **the 4 divine abodes**. First, we should start by accepting ourself and our limitations, and the conditions before us, just as they are—non-judgmentally, with lovingkindness. Then, we work to accept difficult people and situations even when they do not deserve any such attention—this is compassion. Even at the slightest suggestion of a positive development, a tiny ray of light in the pervasive gloom, we rejoice with gladness at it.

²¹ M 7,2 (SD 28.12).

²² On *dharm’uddhacca*, see SD 41.5 (5); SD 32.7 (2.1.4, 2.2.3); SD 41.4 (2.2.1).

Finally, and most significantly, we cultivate and dwell with a heart of equanimity no matter how things turn out—people are conditioned by their karma, the world turns on its own, *and we have done our best, but more needs to be done*. We accept things as they are without any judgement—we do not give up. Such an attitude is that of “**moral independence**,” reflecting thus: “Others may act, speak and think wrongly, but we shall act, speak and think rightly—Thus, self-effacement can be done.”²³

2 Key words of the Sallekha Sutta

2.1 SALLEKHA

2.1.1 Sallekha as used in the Sutta

2.1.1.1 The term *sallekha*²⁴ (Skt *saṃlekha*) comes from *saṃ* (“together,” like Latin *com-* or *con-*) or *sa-* (“own, self”) + √LIKH (“to scratch (off)”), that is, the “scratching away” or “erasing” of unwholesome states, and defined as “austerity, strict abstinence, expunging (M:H), effacement (M:ÑB).” A close translation seems to be “effacement,” since the verb “efface” means “to remove by or as if by rubbing or erasing.”

Considering the usage of the term *sallekha* in this Sutta, we must give some weight to the prefix *sa-* (“own, self”), which is also applicable in such important terms as *sandiṭṭhi* (“self-view”)—as found in the term for mental defilement no (44), *sandiṭṭhi, parāmāsī* [§12.4 etc] and *sambuddha* (“self-awakened,” both as a noun and an adjective).²⁵

2.1.1.2 Putting all this together, we must come up with the English translation, “**self-effacement**,” which naturally reflects the full sense of *sallekha* that we have arrived at—as far as translation capably goes—as it is used in **the Sallekha Sutta**. Before we understand and accept this translation, it is very helpful for us to consider how such a sense is applicable in modern English, and how our quest to understand and translate early Buddhist terms and Pali can help to enrich English as a living language.

2.1.2 Translating *sallekha* as “self-effacement”

2.1.2.1 “**Effacement**” is the abstract noun of the verb, “**efface**” which literally means “to rub out, obliterate (writing, painted or sculptured figures, a mark or stain) from the surface of anything, so as to leave no distinct traces” (OED). Figuratively, “efface” means “to remove from cognizance, consideration or memory” (Webster’s 3rd New International Dictionary = NID3). The Oxford-English Dictionary (OED), similarly, defines it figuratively as “to obliterate, wipe out (a memory, a mental impression).”

2.1.2.2 The English sense of “**self-effacement**” as found in our literary records that are in the common memory of English language experts and users, however, seems only to be in its literal sense, as a noun compound. The OED, for example, defines self-effacement in an only limitedly social usage as “the

²³ This term was first used by Nyanaponika, 1988:16.

²⁴ “Effacement,” *sallekha* (M 8/1:40,30) is given as 漸損 in MĀ 91 (T1.573b25), lit, “gradual reducing (faults)” (foll Fóguang Madhyama Āgama ed 1983:787 n8, which glosses 漸損 as 漸削減過失).

²⁵ For *sa-* (PED sa⁴) as “own, self,” see D 2:209; M 1:366; Sn 509; J 2:7, 3:164, 323 (loc), 402 (acc), 4:249, 5:24 (ins); DhA 3:277 = Pv 2.12,1 (acc); *sa, desa*, “one’s own country” (Dāthv 1.10). Cf *saka* (see PED sv).

keeping of oneself out of sight or in the background.” The NID3 defines it as “effacement of oneself; *specifically*: the placing or keeping of oneself in the background.”²⁶

2.1.2.3 From this, we can naturally and accurately translate it as “**self-effacement**,” which refers to the total removal or abandoning of mental defilements by a Dharma practitioner. The Sallekha Sutta itself provides the context and rationale for translating *sallekha* as “self-effacement” because it starts off with the mention of self-views (*atta, vāda*) [§3], and that the Buddha lists “self-views” (*sandiṭṭhi*) as the 44th or last defilement in the passages on self-effacement [§12], their methods [§§13+14] and benefits [§§15+16].

This an effacement that a true practitioner must make—to completely remove all traces of views from the mind, so that we are free to walk the path of awakening. This is the true meaning of self-effacement.

2.1.3 Sallekha and the Jain *sallekhanā*

2.1.3.1 The word *sallekha* clearly is the Pali cognate of the Jain term ***sallekhanā***, also found in these alternate forms as *samlehana*, *samthāra* (“death-bed”), *samādhi-maraṇa* (“death by samadhi”) or *sanyasana-maraṇa* (the holy death).²⁷ It is a supplementary vow to the moral code of Jainism, and is the religious practice of voluntarily fasting to death by gradually reducing the intake of food and liquids.²⁸

Jainism views this practice as the thinning of human passions and the body,²⁹ and a means of destroying rebirth-influencing karma by withdrawing all physical and mental activities.³⁰ The Jains do not regard it as suicide because it is neither an act of passion nor a death by poison or weapon.³¹ After the *sallekhanā* vow, the ritual preparation and practice can run into years.³²

2.1.3.2 The Buddha **prohibits suicide** for at least two important reasons. The first is the value of life, especially human life, which is difficult to obtain, especially our humanity, which is the basis for practising the Dharma and working towards the path of awakening. If suicide were allowed, people are likely to have a wrong impression of the sangha, and its population will be significantly reduced.³³

The value of life is the basis for the very 1st of the 5 precepts, which is the abstention from destroying life, both human and lesser forms. Furthermore, the 3rd Pātimokkha rule entailing defeat (*pārājika*) prohibits a monastic from taking life, even his own.³⁴ The subject of suicide and Buddhism is further discussed in the notes to **the Chann’ovāda Sutta** (M 144) translation.³⁵

2.1.3.3 Traditional Jainism—an Indian faith which is older than Buddhism—allows suicide for both monastics and the laity. This “religious suicide” is a kind of public and ritual starving, especially for those with a difficult or terminal illness, or who desire a quicker route to Jain liberation.

²⁶ NID3 gives the quote: “Christianity ... in terms of value all derive from a law of *self-effacement*” (R M Weaver). This is, of course, a patently biased, even false, remark, or we may take this to be as true of all good religions. Then again, saying just the opposite is also true, even more so, of religions today.

²⁷ A Sundara, “[Nishidi stones and the ritual of Sallekhana](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sallekhana#cite_note-0-1).” *International School for Jain Studies*, nd; retrieved 13 July 2017. “Sallekhana,” Wikipedia, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sallekhana#cite_note-0-1.

²⁸ See Paul Dundas, *The Jains* [1992], 2nd ed, London & NY: Routledge, 2002:179-181.

²⁹ Vijay K Jain, *Acharya Amritchandra’s Purushartha Siddhyupaya: Realization of the Pure Self, with Hindi and English translation*, Vikalp Printers, 2012:115.

³⁰ Dundas ib.

³¹ Dundad ib.

³² A Sundara ib.

³³ Further, see SD 11.12 (7.1).

³⁴ Pār 3 (V 3:73,10-16).

³⁵ **Chann’ovada S** (M 144 = S 35.87), SD 11.12.

Understandably, such an ascetic practice is likely to serve as a meme, attracting significant attention to Jainism, or at least the idea that suicide can be religious, and hence, a good thing. Clearly, it is the popularity of such ideas of suicide that prompted the Buddha, by way of “natural adaptation,” to use the Jain ascetic term, *sallekhanā*, in a more life-affirming Buddhist sense of *sallekha*, “self-effacement.”

2.2 KEY WORDS RELATING TO THE IMPURITIES

THE SUTTA THESIS

“Cunda, as regard those various views that **arise** [2.2.1] in the world, that is, in connection with self-views or with world-views,

wherever [2.2.2] they arise, wherever they **lie latent** [2.2.3], and wherever they **assail** (the mind) [2.2.4], this is seen as it really is with right wisdom, thus:

‘This is not mine. This I am not. This is not myself.’ (§3.2-3.3)

2.2.1 “(They) arise” (*uppajjanti*)

The Commentary explains that the verb “**arise**” (*uppajjanti*, plural)³⁶ refers here to the arising of views that have not arisen before (MA 1:182,30). In other words, these are the beginnings of our view-formations—like being infected with a bug that then remains with us, proliferating itself and significantly affecting our bodies and minds, our actions and attitudes.

Although there may be some point in our lives that a view is first formed, this always occurs on account of a number of conditions. As the “core notions” of such views stay stuck in our minds, they continue to grow and shape us, and affect our vision and skew our perceptions of things. Left to their devices, they will only strengthen and broaden their hold on our minds and lives.

2.2.2 The object

2.2.2.1 The Sallekha Sutta thesis [2.2] applies a simple word in an interesting phrase: “**wherever** they arise” [§3.2]. “Wherever” (*yattha*) refers to the object or basis of our attention (*ārammaṇa*),³⁷ that is, any of the 5 aggregates (*pañca-khandha*):

- | | |
|--------------------|--|
| (1) form: | things, shapes and colours; |
| (2) feeling: | liking, disliking, neither; |
| (3) perception: | recognizing; |
| (4) formations: | deliberate activity through mind, speech and body; and |
| (5) consciousness: | cognizing. |

All views regarding the self and the world refer to only these aggregates or to one of them.

³⁶ Etym of *uppajjanti*: *uppajjati* (sg) < *ud-* (out and upward) + *pajjati*, “to go” (Ved *padyate*, “to come to fall,” Skt “to go to”; VPAD, to go): meaning, “to come out, to arise, to be produced, to be born or reborn (of beings), to come into existence” (D 1:180,2:307,3 = M 3:250,15; S 1:185,11; Sn 584; Tha 337, 445; Pv 2.1,11).

³⁷ MA 1:182,26. In the suttas, *ārammaṇa* simply means “meditation object; sense-object (as meditation object)” (V 2:333,10; D 3:58,21; S 2:65,16; A 3:312,15; Sn 474; Tha 141); see: **Samādhi,mūlaka Ārammaṇa S** (S 34.5/3:266), SD 107.12, & **Samāpatti,mūlaka Ārammaṇa S** (S 34.35/3:275), SD 107.13. Cf BHS *ārambana*; sometimes = Skt, BHS *ālambana*, meaning “sense-object(s), support for consciousness” (cf P *āyatana*).

2.2.2.2 This is where our views arise (*yattha uppajjanti*) for the first time: wherever our attention is, wherever the mental object is—there views arise (MA 1:182,21). There seems to be a commentarial wordplay on *ārammaṇa*, which has a primary or literal meaning of “point of support, hold” or “starting-point.”

Post-Buddha Abhidhamma gives *ārammaṇa* two key senses:

(1) as *paccaya* (mental condition) or *hetu* (cause), that is, foundation, base; ground, cause, reason;

(2) as *visaya* (sense-field) or *gocara* (mental range), that is, object (of sense or thought).³⁸

We can see here a more developed psychological theory of what in the suttas is called **name-and-form** (*nāma,rūpa*). *Nāma* is the mind, the ground, condition or “cause” that is the sense-faculty; *rūpa* is the object of the senses.³⁹

2.2.2.3 In the dependent arising formula, we have this starting sequence 4 links, as, for example, laid out in **the Kaccā(ya)na,gotta Sutta** (S 12.15).⁴⁰

Ignorance → formations → consciousness → name-and-form → ... (suffering).

Our view-forming habit can be explained as starting with ignorance (*avijjā*), which moves us to act—motivated by *craving* in the form of lust, hate and delusion we are driven by *intentions* as the formations (*saṅkhārā*) arising through mind, speech and body. This feeds our consciousness (or “conscious mind”) (*viññāṇa*) making it more sensitive and sophisticated at detecting and “making sense” of experiences, that is, at constructing name-and-form (*nāma,rūpa*) of them—giving names to forms, giving forms to names; making sense of things, making things of what we sense; giving our reasons for everything that confront us, and still wondering how we are suffering.

2.2.2.4 View-formation, on a deeply mental level, continues with **formations**, when we are driven by intention to form ideas on a mental level, and to speak and act on them. Such views or ideas rise and fall with the moment, and do not really trouble us if we do not pursue them, or do not store them as memories and images in our consciousness—as “prototypes” or fixed views (conceptions and later perceptions) of our experiences: our actions (through mind, speech and body) are somehow dictated by such mental “prototypes.”

This is where we construct views of *self*, and identify with our *body* and its actions, or *feelings*, or *perceptions*, or *formations* (ideas), or *consciousness* (general awareness of things). With this habitual pattern of dependent arising, we form self-views and world-views.⁴¹ And this is where we can and must end the view-formations.

2.2.3 Anusenti

A **view** (*ditṭhi*) is a very private idea of our world of experiences that attracts more of its kind to itself. It is a self-replicating mental process with only the purpose of self-proliferation and constructing the notion of an abiding self. Psychologically, this is called a mememe.⁴²

³⁸ See Abdhs 3.16 (*ālambana,saṅgaha*); Ency Bsm 2:60-62 (*ārammaṇa* & *ārammaṇa-paccaya*).

³⁹ On *nāma,rūpa* as part of the aggregates (*khandha*), see SD 17.1a (4) & SD 17.2a (12); as part of dependent arising (*paṭicca,samuppāda*), see (**Paṭicca,samuppāda**) **Vibhaṅga S** (S 12.2,11) n, SD 5.15.

⁴⁰ S 12.15/2:16 f (SD 6.13); also SD 5.16 (4.1).

⁴¹ For further analysis, see, eg, **Kaccā(ya)na,gotta S** (S 12.15), SD 6.13.

⁴² See **Memes**, SD 26.3.

It's like we take a bit of our own cells or DNA, and culture it in our mind's petri dish. When it grows into an adult "Me," we take a bit more cell and make another culture, and then another, and so on. But after each clone, we lose bit of the originality of the preceding one. All we have are progressively less authentic clones, fading copies, of preceding clones. But the current copy of "Me" fascinates us all the same, and we keep making copies of "Me."⁴³

Once we assimilate any views—or rather when *views* assimilate "us"—they "**lie latent** or dormant" (***anusenti***)⁴⁴ like a virus, gathering strength through our continued adherence to them. Our unfettered sense-experiences—liking and disliking them—feed these mental viruses that populate our "unconscious"—in fact, they *are* our unconscious, **the latent tendencies** (*anusaya*),⁴⁵ that control our every thought, speech and action, like a puppet-master holding and playing with us with its many and strong strings of lust, hate and delusion.⁴⁶

2.2.4 Samudācaranti

Our views—or rather, the roots of these views: lust, hate and delusion, and their various forms—lie latent in our unconscious (we do not even know they are there) [2.2.2]. But at every opportune moment, they **assail** (*samudācaranti*)⁴⁷ us tenaciously bending, twisting and crushing us to reinforce our identity with the carrot-stick of craving ("This is *mine*"), to measure our self against others with conceit ("This *I am*"), and relentlessly push us on to repeat all this with the cycle of wrong view ("This is *my self!*").⁴⁸ These are the 3 pernicious self-views.⁴⁹

When we grasp a view, we take the shape of that view, we become that view: we think, speak and act *as* those views. Each view leads to many more: they proliferate; one thought arouses many others—leading to **mental proliferation** (*papañca*)⁵⁰—like mirrors looking into mirrors. We see an infinity of images: we are fascinated with what we *see*.

We are blinded by what we see. What we see floods our minds, we are drowned in our thoughts; they overflow through our speech and actions drowning others, too, especially those already drowning in their own thoughts, as most of us are.

And so we become our thoughts, existing through them, and being reborn with them to repeat and replay everything all over again, as long as we are unawakened. In the Sallekha Sutta, the Buddha teaches us to stop this fascination with views, to break this vicious cycle, and to completely free ourselves from suffering and rebirth.⁵¹

⁴³ On how "Me" become "Me Me," see **Memes**, SD 26.3.

⁴⁴ Etym of ***anusenti*** (pl): *anuseti* (sg) < *anu-* (along, after) + *vī*, to lie (down); said of things: to lie dormant (continually arising again) (M 1:303,33, 433,1, 3:285,8 f; S 4:188,8, 208,20 f; A 1:283,18 = 2:111,8).

⁴⁵ On the latent tendencies (*anusaya*), see **Anusaya**, SD 31.3.

⁴⁶ See **The unconscious**, SD 17.8b.

⁴⁷ Etym of ***samudācaranti*** (pl): *samudacarati* (sg) < *saṃ-* (together) + *ud-* (out and upward) + *ā-* (presence, dwelling) + *ācarati*, "to do or act (habitually), perform, accomplish" (*CAR*, to go); meaning: to occur to, to befall, beset, assail (M 1:109, 112, 453; S 2:273; It 31). Past part *samudāciṇṇa*, "made a habit of (us)."

⁴⁸ Respectively see **I: The nature of identity**, SD 19.1; **Me: The nature of conceit**, SD 19.2a; **Mine: The nature of craving**, SD 19.3.

⁴⁹ See SD 19.11 (1.1).

⁵⁰ On mental proliferation (*papañca*), see **Madhu,piṇḍika S** (M 18) @ SD 6.14 (2).

⁵¹ On not identifying with anything, see **Atam,mayatā**, SD 19.13.

2.3 PARIKKAMANA [§14]

2.3.1 Sutta usage of *parikkamana*

2.3.1.1 The rare Pali word *parikkamana* is used in two contexts—the literal and the figurative—in the Sallekha Sutta. In the introductory paragraph [§14.1], it is used in the literal sense to refer to the nature of **a path** (*magga*) and **a ford** (*tittha*), both images of *moving or crossing over from an unsafe location to a significantly safer one*. We should avoid an “**uneven**” (*asama*) or rough (Commentary, *visama*) passage (in the second, figurative sense) for an “**even**” (*sama*) or safer and easier one, that is, the noble eightfold path.

In the rest of the passage [§14.2-4], *parikkamana* is used in a figurative sense referring to the shift from an unwholesome condition to a wholesome one, for example, “For the person who is violent, there is **non-violence** *parikkamanāya*” [§14(1)]. We shall now discuss how best to translate *parikkamanāya* in the context of this section [§14].

2.3.1.2 The Sutta commentary gives a detailed explanation of *parikkamma* and its context. Essentially, it explains that just as we would “avoid” (from *parivajjana*, “avoiding”) a rough location with stumps, thorns and stones, etc, for another that is easier to work on;⁵² or we would “avoid” a rough ford badly beset with tree-roots, stones, steep slopes, crocodiles and monsters, for another crossing that is easier (not uneven), that deepens gradually like a staircase⁵³—and then, in comfort, plunge, bathe and emerge from the river.⁵⁴

So, too, we should abandon the unwholesome states for the wholesome ones, so that we are able to properly move on (from *parikkamana*, “going around”) up the path of awakening to our goal. The commentary highlights the two key actions in our struggle to reach the path of awakening—that is, what we must *avoid* and what we must *move on*. Both these senses are implicit or pregnant in the polysemic word *parikkamana*.⁵⁵

2.3.2 Vinaya usage of *parikkamana*

2.3.2.1 The word *parikkamana* is found in the Vinaya in contrasting forms as *sa,parikkamana* and *aparikkamana* in the Old Commentary on **Saṅghādisesa 6**.⁵⁶ The saṅgha should decide the proper location of a monastic hut where no living beings will be harmed or killed, and where there is an open space around it—*Bhikkhū abhinetabbā vatthu,desanāya, tehi bhikkhūhi vatthuṃ desetabbarṃ anārambharṃ sa,parikkamane, sārāmbhe ce bhikkhu vatthusmiṃ aparikkamane saññācīkāya kutiṃ kareyya bhikkhū vā anabhineyya vatthu,desanāya* (Saṅgh 6.1.6).⁵⁷

⁵² *Tass’attho* (“Its meaning”) (It is as if the Buddha is saying:) *Yathā nāma cunda khāṇu,kaṇṭaka,pāsāṇ’ādīhi visamo maggo bhaveyya, tassa parikkamanāya, parivajjan’atthāya añño suparikamma,kato vita bhūmi,bhāgo samo maggo bhaveyya* (MA 1:192,12-15).

⁵³ *Yathā vā rukkhā.mūla,pāsāṇa,papāta,kumbhīla, makar’ādi,pariyādikulaṃ visamaṃ titthaṃ assa, tassa parikkamanāya parivajjan’atthāya aññāṃ avisamaṃ anupubba,gambhīraṃ sopāna,phalaka,sadisāṃ titthaṃ bhaveyya* (MA 1:192,15-18).

⁵⁴ *Yaṃ paṭipanno sukhen’eva taṃ nadim vā talākaṃ vā ajjhogāhetvā nahāyeyya vā uttareyya vā* (MA 1:192,18-20).

⁵⁵ On the polysemy of Pali words, see SD 1.1 (4.4.5) ; SD 10.16 (1.3.1-1.3.2).

⁵⁶ **Saṅgh 6** prescribes the method and dimensions of a hut that a monastic can build for himself.

⁵⁷ Saṅgh 6.1.6 (V 3:149,13-17).

2.3.2.2 The Old Commentary explains *sa,parikkamana* as meaning that it is possible to move around it (the hut) even with a yoke wagon, to move around it with a ladder (Saṅgh 6.1.3).⁵⁸ Clearly, this aspect of the rule addresses the need to have some space around the hut so as to allow free movement around it. It is this idea of *freedom of movement* that should be noted in our translation of *parikkamana*.

2.3.3 Translating *parikkamana*

2.3.3.1 In both the sutta usage [2.3.1] and the Vinaya usage [2.3.2] of *parikkamana*, it has the sense of “avoiding” (from the prefix *pari-*, “around”) something dangerous and negative, and of “turning to, moving on” (from *√KAM*, to go).⁵⁹ Our translation of *parikkamana*, then, must encompass both the senses of “avoiding” and “moving on.” This is noted in the Subcommentary: “*Parikkamanam* means by the act of avoiding, we then move on.”⁶⁰

2.3.3.2 In other words, *parikkamana* has both the **passive** sense of *not* doing any unwholesome act and keeping it so, and the **active** sense of *doing* the wholesome and maintaining that diligence. These are, of course, the 4 right efforts. Basically, we need to combine the senses of “avoiding or going around” with those of “turning to, moving on.” Hence, we come up with the sense of “going around + moving on,” which, in idiomatic English will be “**moving around and beyond** (the impurities).”

2.3.3.3 The word *parikkamana* recurs in **the Parikkamana Sutta** (A 10.175), a close parallel to §14 of the Sallekha Sutta. However, in the Parikkamana Sutta, the 10 unwholesome courses of action has the 3rd impurity as that of *kāmesu micch’ācāra*, “the one indulging in sexual misconduct,” and its opposite (moving on away from it), and the 10th as *micchā,diṭṭhika*, “the one with wrong views,” and its opposite (moving on away from it).⁶¹ *Parikkamana* in **A 10.175** has the same sense of “moving around and beyond” as used in **M 8,14**.

3 The M 8 list of 44 mental impurities

3.1 LIST OF 44 MENTAL DEFILEMENTS

3.1.1 The Sallekha Sutta (M 8) gives a comprehensive list of 44 mental impurities [§§12-16]. In every case, these impurities are also listed with their positive counterparts. These **44 qualities** are organized into the following lists:

(1) The 20 courses of karma	<i>(kusalâkusala kamma,patha)</i>	(1)-(10)	} List A
(2) The tenfold rightness	<i>(dasa sammatta)</i>	(11)-(20)	
(3) The 24 mental impurities	<i>(cittassa upakkilesa)</i>	(21)-(44)	

3.1.2 Section (1). The 10 unwholesome courses of action (*akusala kamma,patha*) and the 10 wholesome courses of action (*kusala kamma,patha*) are well known lists. They are found in such texts as **the Sāleyya-**

⁵⁸ *Sa,parikkamanam nāma sakkā hoti yathā,yuttēna sakaṭena anuparigantum, samantā nisseṇiyā anuparigantum* (Saṅgh 6.1.3 @ V 3:151,26).

⁵⁹ Ie, *√(K)KAM* (I), “to go”: see Warder, *Introduction to Pali*, 2nd ed, 1974, 3rd ed 1999:375

⁶⁰ *Parivajjana,vasena kamanam pavatti parikkamanam’ti* (MAṬ:Be 1:294).

⁶¹ See n113 (§12, “The 10 courses of actions” header).

ka Sutta (M 41) and **the Sañcetanika Sutta** (A 10.206).⁶² While the unwholesome courses of action define bad karmic conduct, the wholesome courses of action define good karmic conduct.

3.1.3 Section (2). The tenfold or ten-limbed wrongness (*dasa micchatta*) and the tenfold rightness (*dasa sammatta*)—lay out the wrong path, and the whole path of awakening, that is, 3 trainings (of moral virtue, concentration and wisdom)⁶³ or the eightfold path and its goals: right knowledge and right freedom, that is, awakening itself.⁶⁴

3.1.4 Section (3). The 24 mental impurities (*cittassa upakkilesa*) (the last 24 pairs of factors) and their opposites form a comprehensive list of common defilements that need to be abandoned to ensure that we are fully ready to take the first step on the path of awakening. A number of these impurities are found elsewhere—defilements (21)-(23), for example, are part of the 5 mental hindrances (*pañca nīvaraṇa*).⁶⁵

Many other defilements are found in similar but shorter lists in other texts, such as the following suttas:

Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda Sutta	D 2,12+15 (in pairs)	SD 1.4	
Dhamma,dāyāda Sutta	M 3,8-15 (in pairs)	+ SD 2.18 (3.5)	Table 3.5
Vatthūpama Sutta	M 7,3	SD 28.12	
Sallekha Sutta	M 8 ,12	SD 51.8	Table 3.2
Cūḷa Assa,pura Sutta	M 40,3+5 (faults of a recluse)	SD 41.8	Table 2.1.1
(Anuruddha) Upakkilesa Sutta	M 128,27+30	SD 5.18 (3.1)	
(Chakka) Vivāda,mūla Sutta	A 6.36 §§2-4, 9-11, 16-17, 23-35, 30-29, 37-39	SD 47.14 (1.1)	
Padhāna Sutta	Sn 3.2 (16 defilements)	SD 2.18 (3.2)	Table 3.2
Vibhaṅga (Abhidhamma)	Vbh 845-846/350, 891-894/357		

3.2 The 44 mental impurities

3.2.1 The first 20 mental impurities (List A)

3.2.1.1 To facilitate an easy grasp of the 44 mental impurities (*cittassa upakkilesa*) and their wholesome opposites listed in the Sallekha Sutta, we can examine them as two separate lists, that is, **List A** comprising (1)-(20) [3.2.1] and **List B**, (21)-(44) [3.2.2]. List A comprises the factors of 10 courses of action and the tenfold rightness that is the noble path.

It is interesting to see here a “non-technical” listing of impurities, not so much for the sake of doctrinal lists, but for the purpose of spiritual practice.⁶⁶ We will later examine this apparent difficulty [3.2.3]

⁶² *Sāleyyaka S* (M 41,11-14), SD 5.7, & *Sañcetanika S* (A 10.206,7.2-12), SD 3.9.

⁶³ On the 3 trainings, see **(Ti) Sikkhā S** (A 3.88) SD 24.10c; *Sīla samādhi paññā*, SD 21.6; SD 1.11 (5).

⁶⁴ On the tenfold rightness (*dasa sammatta*), see SD 10.1 (1.2.2).

⁶⁵ On the 5 mental hindrances, see *Āvaraṇa Nīvaraṇa S* (S 46.38), SD 41.10; *Nīvaraṇa*, SD 32.1.

⁶⁶ On the non-technical tendency of much of the early Buddhist texts, see SD 51.8 (3.2.1.1).

3.2.1.2 Here follows a list of the **first 20 mental impurities** and their opposites in the Sallekha Sutta:

The 10 courses of wrong action [§12.2 n]

(1) violent	<i>vihimsaka</i>
(2) destroyers of life	<i>pāṇātipatī</i>
(3) takers of the not-given	<i>adinn'ādāyī</i>
(4) uncelibate	<i>abrahma,cārī</i>
(5) speakers of falsehood	<i>musa,vādī</i>
(6) slanderers	<i>pisuṇa,vācā</i>
(7) speakers of harsh speech	<i>pharusa,vācā</i>
(8) idle chatterers	<i>samphappalāpī</i>
(9) covetous	<i>abhijjhālu</i> ⁶⁷
(10) a mind of ill will	<i>vyāpanna,citta</i>

The 10 courses of right action

(1) non-violent	<i>avihimsaka</i>
(2) abstaining from it	<i>pāṇātipātā paṭiviratā</i>
(3) abstaining from it	<i>adinn'ādānā p.</i>
(4) celibate	<i>brahmancārī</i>
(5) abstaining from it	<i>musa,vādā paṭiviratā</i>
(6) abstaining from it	<i>pisuṇāya vācāya p.</i>
(7) abstaining from it	<i>pharusāya vācāya p.</i>
(8) abstaining from it	<i>samphappalāpā p</i>
(9) not covetous	<i>anabhijjhālu</i>
(10) a mind free of ill will	<i>avyāpanna,citta</i>

The tenfold wrongness [§12.3 n]

(11) holding wrong views	<i>micchā,ditṭhī</i>
(12) having wrong intention	<i>micchā,sankappā</i>
(13) speaking wrong speech	<i>micchā,vācā</i>
(14) doing wrong action	<i>micchā,kammantā</i>
(15) having wrong livelihood	<i>micchā,ājīvā</i>
(16) making wrong effort	<i>micchā,vāyāmā</i>
(17) having wrong mindfulness	<i>micchā,satī</i>
(18) having wrong concentration	<i>micchā,samādhi</i>
(19) having wrong knowledge	<i>micchā,ñāṇī</i>
(20) having wrong freedom	<i>micchā,vimuttī</i>

The tenfold rightness

(11) holding right view	<i>sammā,ditṭhī</i>
(12) having right intention	<i>sammā,sankappā</i>
(13) speaking right speech	<i>sammā,vācā</i>
(14) doing right action	<i>sammā,kammantā</i>
(15) having right livelihood	<i>sammā,ājīvā</i>
(16) making right effort	<i>sammā,vāyāmā</i>
(17) having right mindfulness	<i>sammā,satī</i>
(18) having right concentration	<i>sammā,samādhi</i>
(19) having right knowledge	<i>sammā,ñāṇī</i>
(20) having right freedom	<i>sammā,vimuttī</i>

Table 3.2.1 (List A). Comparative table of 1st 20 pairs of factors

3.2.1.3 OVERLAPS AND REDUNDANCE? Looking at the above list of **mental impurities** as a whole, we seem to see a few of the factors overlapping.

Wrong view, to begin with, which constitutes factor (11), also functions as the last of the 10 unwholesome courses of action and the first of the 10 wrong path-factors. In keeping with the sequence suggested by the Commentary (MA 1:188), wrong view is only mentioned once [Table 3.2.1].

However, the same principle does not seem to apply to the entire list of defilements. An instance of overlapping of factors seems to occur, for example, between killings (2), stealing (3) and uncelibacy (4), on the one hand, and wrong action (14) on the other—since **wrong action** covers just these three factors.⁶⁸

Another overlap seems to exist between falsehood (5), malicious speech (6), harsh speech (7) and idle chatter (8), on the one hand, and the path-factor of wrong speech (13) on the other—since here, too, the standard definition of **wrong speech** comprises just these four factors.⁶⁹

Another partial overlap seems to occur between covetousness (9) and ill will (10), on the one hand, and wrong intention (12) on the other—since **wrong intentions**, by definition, are intentions of sensual-

⁶⁷ See n on “covetousness, rampant greed,” Table 3.2.2 (1).

⁶⁸ See **Mahā Cattārīsaka S** (M 117): *pāṇātipātō adinnādānaṃ kamesu micchācāro, ayaṃ ... micchā,kammanto* (M 117/3:74,23) (when applied to monastics, as in M 8, *kāmesu micchācāra* becomes *abrahma,cariya*).

⁶⁹ See **Mahā Cattārīsaka S** (M 117): *musā,vādo, pisuṇā vācā, pharusā vāca, samhappalāpo, ayaṃ ... micchā,vācā* (M 117/3:73,29).

ity, ill will and cruelty.⁷⁰ Without these 3 kinds of intention, these 3 unwholesome mental qualities would not be able to occur.

Furthermore, the mention of wrong effort (16), wrong mindfulness (17) and wrong knowledge (19) would have much in common with the later listed factors of being lazy (41), unmindful (42) and lacking wisdom (43).

3.2.1.4 If we follow the commentarial suggestion, several of the wrong path-factors may seem redundant. Now, neither the Madhyama Āgama version nor the Ekōttarika Āgama version mention any of the wrong path-factors. Is it possible that originally, the 10 wrong path-factors do not form a part of the Sutta? This is unlikely, as without the passage on the 10 wrong path-factors, the instructions are clearly incomplete.

It is hard to imagine that the sutta reciters, upon seeing wrong view as the last of the 10 unwholesome courses of action would instinctively or erroneously go on to add *wrong intention, wrong speech*, etc, so adding the 10 wrong path-factors to the Sutta!⁷¹

3.2.1.5 The final test is for us to examine the Sallekha Sutta as a whole—especially as a training text for meditative cultivation for the overcoming of mental impurities and cultivating the wholesome ones. Clearly, it is the Buddha’s intention that his instructions are not merely meant for study but more so for practice. Understandably then, he does not merely list broad doctrinal titles or technical headers (eg, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong intention), but would list actual cases of mental impurities that we must abandon in the context of the noble eightfold path. To do this, he has listed both the courses of actions and the path-factors in a flowing sequential list for our practical benefit—as evident in the list of first 20 mental impurities and their opposites [Table 3.2.1].

3.2.2 The last 24 mental impurities (List B)

3.2.2.1 List A [3.2.1], comprising the first 20 mental impurities and their opposites, based on two well-known doctrinal sets—those of the 10 courses of action and the 10 path-factors—is followed by a longer **List B** of 24 mental impurities and their opposites, which are even more “down-to-earth” than the first list. List B deals with various common negative emotions and psychological states that we—especially those who have expressly aspired to walk the path of awakening in this life itself—must overcome.

3.2.2.2 The last 24 mental impurities and their opposites [§12] can be conveniently studied as a set. They are tabulated [Table 3.2.2] for a comparative study of a similar list in **the Vatthūpama Sutta** (M 7). For the mentions of these impurities in the suttas and texts, see (3.4), which deals with the last 7 mental impurities (and their opposites), the most commonly mentioned of them.

⁷⁰ See **Mahā Cattārisaka S** (M 117): *kāma,saṅkappo vyāpāda,saṅkappo vihiṃsa,saṅkappo, ayaṃ ... micchā,saṅkappo* (M 117/3:73,2).

⁷¹ Scholars like, von Hinüber, have suggested that “pieces of texts known by heart may intrude into almost any context once there is a corresponding key word” (*A Handbook of Pali*, 1996:31). Even when this does occur—by way of faulty recitation—such errors would easily be noticed by the redactors, sutta specialists or even students, and then corrected. Although “uncontrolled orality” may occur in folk or cultural oral traditions, it is unlikely to occur in the suttas—esp the suttas—which are periodically edited and examined by monastic specialists and scholars down through the ages.

Vatthûpama Sutta (M 7)

(M 7,3 @ SD 28.12)

- (1) covetousness, rampant greed
- (2) ill will
- (3) anger
- (4) grudge [resentment]
- (5) scorn [contempt]
- (6) spite [malice]
- (7) jealousy [envy]
- (8) miserliness [stinginess]
- (9) deceit
- (10) fraud [hypocrisy]
- (11) callousness [stubbornness]
- (12) impetuosity [rivalry]
- (13) conceit
- (14) arrogance
- (15) mental intoxication [pride]
- (16) heedlessness [negligence]

KEY

- √ = coinciding factors
X = unrelated factors

*abhijjhā, visama, lobha*⁷² X
vyāpāda X
kodha
*upanāha*⁷³
*makkhā*⁷⁴
paḷāsa
issā
macchariya
māyā
*sāṭheyya*⁷⁵
*thambha*⁷⁶
*sārambha*⁷⁷
māna
atimāna
mada
pamāda

The last 7 factors [3.4.1]

Sallekha Sutta (M 8)

(M 8,12 @ SD 51.8)

- the last 24 impurities
- (21) *thina, middha* slothful, torporific
 - (22) *uddhatā* restless
 - (23) *vicikicchī* doubtful
 - (24) *kodhana* angry
 - (25) *upanāhī* grudging
 - (26) *makkhī* scornful
 - (27) *paḷāsī* spiteful
 - (28) *issukī* jealousy
 - (29) *maccharī* miserly
 - (30) *saṭha* fraudulent
 - (31) *māyāvī* deceitful
 - (32) *thaddhā* callous
 - (33) *atimānī* arrogant
 - (34) *dubbacā* hard to speak to
 - (35) *papa, mittā* bad friend
 - (36) *pamattā* heedless
 - (37) *assaddhā* lacking faith
 - (38) *ahirikā* morally shameless
 - (39) *anottāpī* lacking moral fear
 - (40) *appa-s, suta* lacking learning
 - (41) *kusitā* lazy
 - (42) *muṭṭha-s, sati* unmindful
 - (43) *duppaññā* lacking wisdom
 - (44) *sandiṭṭhi, -parāmāsī* clinging to self-view

Table 3.2.2 (List B). Comparative table of mental impurities⁷⁸

⁷² Comy to **Vatthûpama S** (M 7) def **abhijjhā** as desire-or-lust (*chanda, rāga*) for our own things, while **visama, -lobha** is desire-or-lust for those of others. DA defs *visama, lobha* as excessive greed (or neurotic desire) by way of consuming things (*paribhoga, yuttetu pi ṭhānesu atibalava, lobho*), in other words, excessive materialism and consumerism (DA 3:853): see SD 31.7 (7.1). Our sutta comy discussed other distinctions, but concludes that, since all greed is disharmonious (*visama*), the two terms should be understood as synonyms (MA 1:169). However, when *abhijjhā* is used by itself or in the dvandva, **abhijjhā, domanassa**, it is usually rendered as “covetousness and displeasure” (eg M 10,3/1:56) & SD 13.1 (4.2). I think *abhijjhā, visama, lobha* is synonymous with *chanda, rāga*, so that, likewise, the former (*abhijjhā*) refers to the desire for an unacquired object, while the latter (*visama, lobha*) is the attachment to the acquired object (Abhidharma, kośa Vyākhyā): see **Kāma-c, chanda**, SD 32.2 (2.1).

⁷³ *Upanāha*, “grudge,” see §12.4 (25) n.

⁷⁴ *Makkha*, derogatory conduct, see §12.4 (26).

⁷⁵ *Sāṭheyya*, “fraud,” ie, hypocrisy, pretence, pretentiousness (Vbh 894/358).

⁷⁶ *Thambha*. See (**Chakka**) **Arahatta S** (A 6.76/3:429), where Comys explain *thambha* as inflexibility, “like bellows full of air” (MA 1:170), or “a state of callousness by way of anger and conceit” (*kodha, mānehi thaddha, bhāvam*) (AA 3:411). It is actually a form of conceit (*māna*).

⁷⁷ *Sārambha*. “impetuosity” (Sn 328c); the drive to outdo others (MA 1:170); “the habit of drawing out conflicting action” (*paccanīka, sātātā, saṅkhāto*, SnA 334); in other words, “competitiveness, one-upmanship.” See **Paccanīka S** (S 7.16/1:178), SD 50.37.

⁷⁸ See [3.2.1.1]. The Chin MĀ 91 list omits (32)-(44) (Analayo op cit, 2011:62). Cf Table 2.1.1 (SD 41.8). See also Cousins 2009:33.

3.3 THE 44 MODES OF SELF-EFFACEMENT

3.3.1 The full list of 44 pairs of factors comprises pairs of opposing mental qualities: the mental defilements and their purified forms. By way of practice, we can call them “**the 44 modes of self-effacement**,” those qualities that we must work to eradicate and those qualities we must cultivate for reaching the path of awakening.

3.3.2 The 44 modes comprise various sets of doctrinal teachings, which can be identified as follows (listed here not forming any fixed sets, but to give us an idea of their composition):

- (2)-(11) the 10 unwholesome courses of action (*akusala kamma,patha*) and the 10 wholesome courses of action (*kusala kamma,patha*): see **Sammā Diṭṭhi Sutta** (M 9,4+6), SD 11.14.
- (12)-(18) the last 7 factors—the wrong (*micchā*) and the right (*sammā*)—of the noble eightfold path (*ariyaṭṭh’āṅgika magga*); the 1st factor is the same as (11). For the Sutta, see the following.
- (19)-(20) the last two limbs of the 10 path-factors, the wrong (*micchatta*) and the right (*sammatta*): see **Mahā Cattārisaka Sutta** (M 117,34-36), SD 6.10.
- (21)-(23) the last 3 of the 5 mental hindrances (*pañca,nīvaraṇa*); the first 2 hindrances are the same as (9) and (10): see **Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta** (M 10,36), SD 13.3.
- (24)-(33) these are 10 of the 16 mental impurities (*cittassa upakkilesa*): for a close overlap, see **Vatthūpama Sutta** (M 7,3), SD 28.12. [Table 3.2.2]
- (34)-(36) not found elsewhere as a set, but see *dubbaca*: **(Kassapa) Ovāda Sutta 1** (S 16.6/2:204), SD 88.3; **Sugata Vinaya Sutta** (A 4.160/2:147), SD 6.7; **Saddhamma Sammosa Sutta 2** (A 5.155-/3:178), SD 77.4; *pāpa,mitta*: **(Ekaka) Pāpa,mitta Sutta** (A 1.8.10/1:13), SD **(Duka) Dovacasatā Sutta** (A 1:83), **Sāmaka Sutta** (A 6.21/3:310); *pamattā*: **Khagga,visāṇa Sutta** (Sn 57); **Sigāl’ovada S** (D 31,22/3:187, 31.2/190), SD 4.1.
- (37)-(44) the 8 bad qualities and the 8 good qualities (*saddhamma*): the 1st 7 factors are the same as the “7 good qualities”⁷⁹ of **the Sekha Sutta** (M 53,11-17), SD 21.14. [3.4.1]

3.4 THE LAST 7 FACTORS

3.4.1 The special set of 7 factors or qualities—(37)-(43), that is, omitting factor (44)—is found elsewhere, such as in the following suttas:⁸⁰

Saṅgīti Sutta	D 33,2.3(4)/3:252	“the 7 bad qualities” (<i>satta asaddhammā</i>)
	D 33,2.3(5)/3:252	“the 7 good qualities” (<i>satta saddhammā</i>)
Das’uttara Sutta	D 34,1.8(5)/3:282	“the 7 things that conduce to loss” (<i>satta dhamma hāna,bhāgiyā</i>)
	D 34,1.8(6)/3:282	“the 7 things that conduce to distinction” (<i>satta dhammā visesa,-bhāgiyā</i>)
Sekha Sutta	M 53,11-17	“the 7 good qualities” (<i>satta saddhamma</i>), SD 21.14
(Sattaka) Asaddhamma Sutta	A 7.80c/4:145	“the 7 bad qualities” (<i>satta asaddhammā</i>)
	A 7.80d/4:145	“the 7 good qualities” (<i>satta saddhamma</i>)

The same 7 are listed in various ways in **S 14.17-29/2:159-165**.

⁷⁹ The “8th factor” of **Sekha S** (M 53,18) is a quality by itself, that of the attaining at will of the 4 dhyanas (SD 21.14).

⁸⁰ For commentary, see MA 1:90.

3.4.2 According to **the (Chakka) Anāgāmi Sutta** (A 6.65), one lacking **6 factors**—(37)-(39), (41)-(43): lack of faith, lack of moral shame and moral fear, laziness, unmindfulness and lack of wisdom—is *incapable* of realizing non-returning, while those with these **6 qualities**—faith, moral shame, moral fear, industry, mindfulness and wisdom—are *capable* of realizing non-returning (A 6.65/3:421), SD 105.18.

3.4.3 The set of **5 factors**—(37)-(39), (41), (42): lack of faith, lack of moral shame and moral fear, laziness and unmindfulness—when found in a monk, disqualifies him from ordaining anyone, or giving tutelage (monastic guidance) to anyone, or having a novice to attend him. Conversely, only a monk who has *faith, moral shame, moral fear, industry and mindfulness* may ordain and guide others, and be served by a novice. (Mv 1.36.6-7 @ V 1:63)

3.4.4 According to **the (Catukka) Ahirika Sutta** (A 4.219), one who is *faithless, immoral, without moral shame, without moral fear* will be reborn in hellish states; while those with faith, moral virtue, moral shame and moral fear will be reborn in the heavens.⁸¹

According to **the (Catukka) Duppañña Sutta** (A 4.220), one who is *faithless, immoral, lazy and unwise* will be reborn in the hellish states; while those with faith, moral virtue, diligence and wisdom will be reborn in the heavens.⁸²

4 Mahā Cunda

4.1 Mahā Cunda is an elder who lives in Saha,jāti, a market-town in Cetī country.⁸³ He is Sāriputta’s younger brother,⁸⁴ and the elder brother of Revata Khadira,vaniya (“of the acacia forest”), the youngest of the brothers (DhA 2:189). Cunda renounces under Sāriputta, and later gains arhathood after much strenuous effort.

Cunda is Sāriputta’s attendant at the time of the latter’s death. **The (Sāriputta) Cunda Sutta** (S 47.13) tells us that Cunda first informs Ānanda, his preceptor (SA 3:221). Cunda brings Sāriputta’s relics in a bowl and presents them to the Buddha, who then praises Sāriputta.⁸⁵

4.2 The Commentaries identify Mahā Cunda with **Cunda Samaṇ’uddesa**, “the novice.”⁸⁶ He is so called before his full ordination (*upasampadā*), but the appellation remains.⁸⁷ This is probably his alternate name in his senior years. At one time, he is the Buddha’s personal attendant.⁸⁸ Mahā Cunda is one of the 80 great elders, which testifies to his eminence.⁸⁹ His elder’s verses are at **Tha 141-142**.

⁸¹ A 4.219/2:227 (Be 15:449).

⁸² Be **Dussīla S** (A 4.220/2:227 f) = Be 15:550.

⁸³ Sahajāti, vll Be *Sayamjāti*; Se *Sañjāti*; Ce *Sahañcanika*. Prob located on the Ganges. AA 3:379. **Mahā Cunda S** (A 10.24) locates Mahā Cunda there (A 10.24/5:41-45), SD 72.12. This is where Soreyya Revata meets the elders led by Yasa regarding the 10 indulgences (V 2:200) [**Money and monastics**, SD 4.19-23].

⁸⁴ AA 3:379; DhA 2:188; ThaA 1:261. For details on Mahā Cunda, see SIN: Cunda Samaṇ’uddesa.

⁸⁵ S 47.13/5:161-163 (SD 110.5).

⁸⁶ Eg DA 3:907; AA 3:379; DhA 2:188; ThaA 2:18, 3:111. Dh Comy tells how a 7-year-old novice (*sāmaṇera*) Cunda offers to perform a psychic wonder for the Buddha (DhA 3:211), but this is prob another namesake.

⁸⁷ DA 3:907; MA 4:36; SA 3:213; AA 3:379; DhA 2:188; ThaA 2:18.

⁸⁸ DA 3:907; SA 1:258, 3:213; AA 1:293; ThaA 3:111; ApA 307.

⁸⁹ ThaA 3:205.

4.3 SUTTAS CONNECTED WITH MAHĀ CUNDA

4.3.1 Suttas on Mahā Cunda's dealing with "over-estimation"

4.3.1.1 Chann'ovāda Sutta (M 144,11/3:266) = Channa Sutta (S 35.87/4:59,7), SD 11.12

Mahā Cunda instructs the monk Channa, who, apparently, has overestimated his level of attainment. He has not yet attained arhathood, and thinks that he has. However, Channa does later attain arhathood immediately following his suicide. [4.3.3.3]

4.3.1.2 (Dullābha) Mahā Cunda Sutta (A 6.46/3:355,6), SD 4.6

Mahā Cunda criticizes the conceited attitude of some monks, who either because of their theoretical knowledge of the Dharma, or because of their meditation practice, speak disparagingly of the other. [4.3.2.2]

4.3.1.3 Mahā Cunda Sutta (A 10.24/5:42,3), SD 72.12 & Katthī Sutta (A 10.85/5:157,25), SD 68.8

Two occasions when Mahā Cunda examines the false claims made by monks who overestimate their attainment. Such instructions are to help the monks curb their conceit and to be truly diligent in their practice. [4.3.2.3 + 4.3.2.4]

4.3.2 Suttas where Mahā Cunda prominently features

4.3.2.1 (Bhagavā) Gilāna Sutta 3 (S 46.16/5:81), SD 43.13.

Once, when the Buddha lies ill in the squirrels' feeding-ground near Rāja,gaha, Cunda visits him and the Buddha asks him to recite the 7 awakening-factors (*bojjhaṅga*), after which the Buddha promptly recovers.⁹⁰

4.3.2.2 (Dullābha) Mahā Cunda Sutta (A 6.46/3:355 f), SD 4.6

(Sahajāti in Cetī.) He admonishes that scholar monks and contemplative monks should not despise one another, but should value one another since both parties have their own special and valuable talents. From the nature of the problem, mentioned in the (Dullābha) Mahā Cunda Sutta, it is likely that this occurs after the Buddha's passing. [4.3.1.2]

4.3.2.3 Mahā Cunda Sutta (A 10.24/5:41-45), SD 72.12

(Sahajāti in Cetī.) Cunda explains how a monk's declaration of knowledge and of development should reflect that one has actually overcome greed (*lobha*), hatred (*dosa*), delusion (*moha*), anger (*kodha*), grudge (*upanāha*), scorn (*makkha*), spite (*paḷāsa*), miserliness (*macchariya*), bad envy (*pāpikā issā*), and bad wishing (*pāpikā icchā*). [Cf 3.2]

4.3.2.4 Katthī Sutta (A 10.85/5:157-164), SD 68.8

(Sahajāti in Cetī.) Mahā Cunda teaches that one with 10 defilements will not be able to attain any form dhyana, much less the formless dhyanas. That is, one who is immoral (*dussīla*), without faith (*asad-dha*), who has little learning (*appa-s,suta*), difficult to talk to (*dubbaca*), a bad friend (*papa,mitta*), lazy (*kusīta*), unmindful (*muṭṭha-s,sati*), deceitful (*kuhaka*), difficult to support (*dubbhara*) and weak in wis-

⁹⁰ The Saṃyukta Āgama version (Chinese tr), however, says this other monk is **Mahā Koṭṭhita** (Chin 摩訶拘絺羅, SĀ 1266 = T2.347b,18). For more details, see **Pāsādika S** (D 29) @ SD 40a.6 (3).

dom (*duppañña*) [Cf 3.2]. Even when such a person boasts of meditative attainments, when questioned by the wise, he will be exposed.

4.3.3 Suttas where Mahā Cunda features with other elders

4.3.3.1 Pāsādika Sutta (D 29,1-2/3:117 f), SD 40a.6

The Sutta opens with Cunda Samaṇ'uddesa having just emerged from the rains at Pāvā. He meets with Ānanda and reports to him of Nirgrantha Nāta,putta's death and the consequent dissension amongst the Nirgranthas (the Jains). On Ānanda's suggestion, they visit the Buddha at Sāma,gāma to report to him.

4.3.3.2 Aṇāpāṇa,sati Sutta (M 118,1/3:78), SD 7.13

Mahā Cunda is one of the great elders present when the Buddha gives this teaching on the mindfulness of the breath in Migāra's mansion in the Eastern Park, outside Sāvattihī.

4.3.3.3 Chann'ovāda Sutta (M 144/3:263 f) = **Channa Sutta** (S 35.87/4:501), SD 11.12

Mahā Cunda accompanies Sāriputta on a visit to the sick Channa and admonishes him against suicide. [4.3.1.1]

4.3.3.4 (Ovāda) Channa Sutta (S 35.87/4:501), SD 11.12 = preceding [4.3.3.3].

4.3.3.5 Soppa Sutta (A 6.17/3:298-301), SD 92.9

Mahā Cunda is one of the elders present before the Buddha, but when the Buddha retires, they, too, went to their respective quarters to rest and meditate. The newly ordained monks who remain behind have fallen asleep and are snoring away in the Dharma-hall. Noticing this, the Buddha admonishes them to practise moderation in food (*bhojane mattañña*) and devotion to wakefulness (*jāgariyam anuyutta*), dwelling with insight into wholesome states, and devoted to cultivation the limbs of awakening.⁹¹

4.3.3.6 (Udāna) Brāhmaṇa Sutta (U 1.5/3), SD 92.10

Mahā Cunda is one amongst the great elders whom the Buddha announces as "brahmins" (*brāhmaṇa*)—that is, truly accomplished arhats—to the monks.

4.3.3.7 Mahā,parinibbāna Sutta (D 16,4.39n/2:134 f), SD 9; = U 8.5/84,7

Cunda or Cundaka, as he is called here, accompanies the Buddha on his last journey to Kusi,nārā. In the mango grove by the Kakutthā river, he spreads a bed for the Buddha.⁹²

4.3.3.8 Pācittiya 29 (V 4:66)

When the nun Thulla,nandā questions a certain householder on the abundance of food that he has prepared, he answers that it is to be offered to the great elders, amongst whom is Mahā Cunda.

— — —

⁹¹ On the 37 limbs of awakening (*bodhi,pakkhika dhamma*), see SD 10.1.

⁹² D 16,4.39n/2:134 f (SD 9); also recurs at U 8.5/84,7.

The Discourse on Self-effacement

M 8

1 Thus have I heard.

At one time, the Blessed One was residing in Anātha,piṇḍika's park monastery in Jeta's grove outside Sāvattḥī.

Mahā Cunda's question

2 Then, the venerable Mahā Cunda, having emerged from his evening solitude, approached the Blessed One, saluted him, and sat down at one side.

Seated thus at one side, the venerable Mahā Cunda said this to the Blessed One:

3 “Bhante, various views⁹³ arise in the world, that is, in connection with self-views or with world-views.⁹⁴ Now, bhante, does the abandoning or relinquishing of these views occur in a monk at the very beginning when he is wisely attending (to his meditation training)?”⁹⁵

THE SUTTA THESIS⁹⁶

3.2 “Cunda, as regard those *various views that arise in the world, that is, in connection with self-views or with world-views,*

3.3 wherever⁹⁷ they arise, wherever they lie latent,⁹⁸ and wherever they assail (the mind),⁹⁹ this is seen as it really is with right wisdom, thus:

⁹³ “Views,” *diṭṭhi*, meaning “wrong views” (MA 1:182). There are a total of **20 wrong views** related to the self (*atta, vāda*; technically, *attānudiṭṭhi*: **Attā'nudiṭṭhi Pahāna S**, S 35.168 @ SD 53.13)—technically, “self-identity views” (*sakkāya, diṭṭhi*)—in terms of the 5 aggregates (*pañca-k, khandha*) x the 4 self-identity views: : **Cūḷa Vedalla S** (M 44,7), SD 40a.9; **Upāda Paritassanā S** (S 22.7/3:16), SD 97.10; (**Catukka Pema S** (A 4.200/2:214 f), SD 105.11. Self-views and world-views—a total of **16 views**—are discussed in **Pañca-t, taya S** (M 102), SD 40a.12. There are **4 views** about the world (*loka, vāda*): it is eternal, or not eternal; it is finite, or infinite: **Cūḷa Māluṅkyā, putta S** (M 63) + SD 5.8 (2); **Aggi Vaccha, gotta S** (M 72,13 etc), SD 6.15. See also **Brahma, jāla S** (D 1): 4 views about self + universe (D 1,1.31-35), 4 extension views (D 1,2.16-21), SD 25.

⁹⁴ *Yā imā, bhante, aneka, vihitā diṭṭhiyo loke uppajjanti, atta, vāda, paṭisaṃyuttā vā loka. vāda, paṭisaṃyuttā vā.*

⁹⁵ *Ādim eva nu kho bhante bhikkhuno manasikaroto evam etāsaṃ diṭṭhinaṃ pahānaṃ hoti, evam etāsaṃ diṭṭhinaṃ paṭinissaggo hotīti.* Comy: Māha Cunda asks this question regarding one who has only gained the initial stages of insight (*vipassanā*) without attaining streamwinning. This abandonment discussed here is that by eradication (*samuccheda-p, pahāna*), occurring only at streamwinning. Mahā Cunda asks this question because some meditators were over-rating their attainment, thinking that they have abandoned such views while they have not really eradicated them. (MA 1:182,9). [1.1.1.3]

⁹⁶ This is the essence of the Sallekha S teaching, and which is elaborated in theory and practice in the rest of the Sutta. [2.2]

⁹⁷ Hereon: *Yattha c' etā [Ce ca] diṭṭhiyo uppajjanti, yattha ca anusenti, yattha ca samudācaranti, taṃ n' etaṃ mama, n' eso'ham asmi, na me' so attā' ti evam etaṃ yathābhūtaṃ samma-p, paññāya passato; evam etāsaṃ diṭṭhinaṃ pahānaṃ hoti, evam etāsaṃ diṭṭhinaṃ paṭinissaggo hoti.* **Yattha**, glossed by Comy as “in whatever object” (*yasmim arammane*). See [2.2.4].

⁹⁸ On how latent tendencies (*anusaya*) arise, see **Sall'atṭhena S** (S 36.6,8) SD 5.5.

⁹⁹ From “Whenever ... ,” *yattha c' etā diṭṭhiyo uppajjanti yattha ca anusenti yattha ca samudācaranti.* On *samudācarati*, “assails,” see M 1:109, 112, 453; S 2:273; It 31; Vism 343. Cf **Madhu, piṇḍika S** (M 18,7), SD 6.14.

‘This is not mine. This I am not. This is not myself.’¹⁰⁰

Thus, there is the abandoning of those views. Thus, there is the relinquishing of those views.¹⁰¹

The 8 attainments

(1) THE 1ST DHYANA

4 It is, however, possible, too, Cunda, that quite secluded [detached] from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome mental states, he attains and dwells¹⁰² in the 1st dhyana, accompanied by initial application and sustained application, and with zest and joy born of solitude.¹⁰³

He might think thus: ‘I’m abiding in self-effacement!’¹⁰⁴

But, Cunda, in the noble ones’ discipline, these are not called ‘self-effacement.’¹⁰⁵

In the noble ones’ discipline, these¹⁰⁶ are called ‘pleasant abidings here and now.’¹⁰⁷ [41]

¹⁰⁰ *N’etaṃ mama, n’eso’ham asmi, na me so attā’ti*: **Mahā Rāhul’ovāda S** (M 62,3 passim) SD 3.11; **Anatta Lak-khaṇa S** (S 22.59), SD 1.2. **Mahā Hatthi, padopama S** (M 28,7) states: “There can be no considering that (element) as ‘I’ or ‘mine’ or ‘I am’” (M 28,7/1:185), which represents respectively the 3 kinds of mental proliferation (*papañca*) of self-view (*sakkāya diṭṭhi*), craving (*taṇhā*) and conceit (*māna*) (Nm 280; Vbh 393; Nett 37 f), or as “graspings” (*gāha*), namely, view (*diṭṭhi*), craving, conceit (MA 2:111, 225). Detailed studies, respectively see: **I: The nature of identity**, SD 19.1; **Me: The nature of conceit**, SD 19.2a; **Mine: The nature of craving**, SD 19.3. On “mental proliferation” (*pa-pañca*), see **Madhu, piṇḍika S** (M 18), SD 6.14 (2).

¹⁰¹ Comy: By this passage, the Buddha shows the means for eradicating these views, that is, by contemplating the 5 aggregates as “not mine,” etc, with the wisdom of insight culminating in the path of streamwinning (MA 1:183).

¹⁰² “Dwells,” *viharati*, here with a dynamic sense of the effort and transformation of spiritual practice, ie, moving ever higher on the spiral path of awakening. Comys gloss *viharati* by verbs of mental effort and change represented by *kammaṭṭhāna*, “the basis for action,” which is also a word for “meditation” (MA 1:244 f). **Vibhaṅga** explains *viharati* as: “Assumes the postures (for meditation), exists, protects, keeps going, maintains, turns about, dwells. Therefore, it is called *viharati*” (*viharatīti iriyati vattati pāleti yapeti yāpeti cārati viharati; tena vuccati viharatīti*, Vbh 252 = AA 1:71, qu at VA 1:147 = 4:788 = DhsA 167; also D 1:70, 3:758; MA 1:243, 245, 2:206; ItA 2:129); Nc 237.

¹⁰³ “Born of solitude,” *viveka, ja*; ie, it is the result of abandoning the hindrances: on the 3 kinds of solitude, see **The body in Buddhism**, SD 29.6a (1.5). On the omission of “one-pointedness of mind” (*cittassa ek’aggatā*) and “stillness” (*samādhi*) here, see **The layman and dhyana**, SD 8.5.

¹⁰⁴ *Tassa evam assa “sallekhena viharāmīti*.

¹⁰⁵ Elsewhere, the 8 attainments are presented as an integral part of the Buddhist training: see **Nivāpa S** (M 25,12-19), SD 61.2; **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,34-42), SD 1.11. The 4 dhyanas are “pleasant dwellings here and now” (*diṭṭha.dhamma, sukha.vihāra*): **Samādhi Bhāvanā S** (A 4.41,2) SD 24.1. The Buddha declares the 4 dhyanas to be his “divine great high couch” (*dibba ucca, sayana mahā, sayana*): **Venāga, pura S** (A 3.63,5), SD 21.1. On *sallekha* [2.1].

¹⁰⁶ “These” *ete* (pl), ie, the properties of the dhyana (*jhāna, dhammā*) (throughout) (MA 1:186,11).

¹⁰⁷ *Diṭṭha, dhamma, sukha, vihārā ete ariyassa vinaye vuccanti*. This refrain on “pleasant dwellings” is for the form dhyanas [§§4-7]. They are so called because these dhyanas are characterized by profound joyful (*sukha*). The formless attainments are differently named [§8: see n of “peaceful abidings”]; as “dwelling happily here and now” (*diṭṭha.dhamma, sukha.vihāra*): **Samādhi Bhāvanā S** (A 4.41,2), SD 24.1. Comy: Having answered the elder’s question, the Buddha now turns to another type of over-estimator: those who attain the 8 attainments and believe that they are practising self-effacement (*sallekha*) [2.1], when they are really not. They should not be called so because the one who attains them does not use them as a basis for insight—as described in **Aṭṭhaka, nāgara S** (M 52), SD 41.2, and **Mahā Māluṅkya, putta S** (M 64), SD 21.10—but only as a means of enjoying comfort and peace (MA 1:186).

(2) THE 2ND DHYANA

5 It is possible, too, Cunda, that
with the stilling of initial application and sustained application,
 by gaining inner tranquillity and oneness of mind,
 he attains and dwells in **the 2nd dhyana**,
 free from initial application and sustained application,
 with zest and joy born of stillness [samadhi].¹⁰⁸
He might think thus: 'I'm abiding in self-effacement!'
But, Cunda, in the noble ones' discipline, these are not called 'self-effacement.'
In the noble ones' discipline, these are called 'pleasant abidings here and now.'

(3) THE 3RD DHYANA

6 It is possible, too, Cunda, that
with the fading away of zest,
 he remains equanimous, mindful and clearly knowing, and
 feels joy with the body.¹⁰⁹
 He attains and dwells in **the 3rd dhyana**,
 of which the noble ones declare, 'Happily he dwells in equanimity and mindfulness.'
He might think thus: 'I'm abiding in self-effacement!'
But, Cunda, in the noble ones' discipline, these are not called 'self-effacement.'
In the noble ones' discipline, these are called 'pleasant abidings here and now.'

(4) THE 4TH DHYANA

7 It is possible, too, Cunda, that
with the abandoning of joy and abandoning of pain,¹¹⁰
 and with the earlier disappearance of pleasure and displeasure,
 he attains and dwells in **the fourth dhyana**
 that is neither painful nor pleasant, and
 with mindfulness fully purified by equanimity.¹¹¹
He might think thus: 'I'm abiding in self-effacement!'
But, Cunda, in the noble ones' discipline, these are not called 'self-effacement.'
In the noble ones' discipline, these are called 'pleasant abidings here and now.'

¹⁰⁸ The 2nd dhyana is known as "the noble silence" (*ariya, tuṅhī, bhāva*) because within its initial application and sustained application (thinking and discursion, *vitakka, vicāra*) cease, and with their cessation, speech cannot occur. (S 2:273); cf **Kāma, bhū S 2** (S 41.6) where *vitakka* and *vicāra* are called verbal formation (*vacī, saṅkhāra*), the mental factors responsible for speech (S 41.6/4:293), SD 48.7. In **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 1:161), the Buddha exhorts the monks when assembled to "either speak on the Dharma or observe the noble silence" (ie, either talk Dharma or meditate). See **Dutiya Jhāna Pañha S** (S 40.2/4:263 f), SD 24.12.

¹⁰⁹ On this point, see **The Buddha discovers dhyana** @ SD 33.1b (6.4.1): On coming out of dhyana.

¹¹⁰ "Joy and pain," *sukha, dukkha*: this refers to the physical feelings. The next phrase—"pleasure and displeasure," *domanassa, somanassa*—refers to mental feelings, which have been transcended earlier. Mental feelings need to be overcome first so that the mind is not distracted by itself, as it were. Then, all the other feelings (arising from the physical sense-contacts) are transcended: on its significance, see **Sall'atthana S** (S 36.6/4:207-210), SD 5.5.

¹¹¹ Here, **Vibhaṅga** gives 3 factors of the 4th dhyana—equanimity (*upekkhā*), mindfulness (*satī*) and one-pointedness of mind (*cittassa ek'aggatā*)—according to the Sutta analysis (Vbh 261), and 2 factors—equanimity and one-pointedness of the mind—according to the Abhidhamma analysis (Vbh 164; Vism 4.183/165). See **Dhyana** @ SD 8.4 (5.4).

(5) THE BASE OF INFINITE SPACE

8 It is possible, too, Cunda, that

By completely transcending the perceptions of form (*rūpa,saññā*),
with the disappearance the perceptions of sense-reaction [sense-impingement] (*patigha,saññā*),
with non-attention to perceptions of diversity (*ñānatta,saññā*),
aware that ‘Space is infinite,’

he attains and dwells in **the base of infinite space**.¹¹²

He might think thus: ‘I’m abiding in self-effacement!’

But, Cunda, in the noble ones’ discipline, these are not called ‘self-effacement.’

In the noble ones’ discipline, these are called ‘peaceful abidings.’¹¹³

(6) THE BASE OF INFINITE CONSCIOUSNESS

9 It is possible, too, Cunda, that

By completely transcending the base of infinite space,
aware that ‘Consciousness is infinite,’

he attains and dwells in **the base of infinite consciousness**.¹¹⁴

He might think thus: ‘I’m abiding in self-effacement!’

But, Cunda, in the noble ones’ discipline, these are not called ‘self-effacement.’

In the noble ones’ discipline, these are called ‘peaceful abidings.’

(7) THE BASE OF NOTHINGNESS

10 It is possible, too, Cunda, that

By completely transcending the base of infinite consciousness,
aware that ‘There is nothing,’

he attains and dwells in **the sphere of nothingness**.¹¹⁵

He might think thus: ‘I’m abiding in self-effacement!’

But, Cunda, in the noble ones’ discipline, these are not called ‘self-effacement.’

In the noble ones’ discipline, these are called ‘peaceful abidings.’

(8) THE BASE OF NEITHER-PERCEPTION-NOR-NON-PERCEPTION

11 It is possible, too, Cunda, that

By completely transcending the sphere of nothingness,

he enters and dwells in **the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception**.¹¹⁶

He might think thus: ‘I’m abiding in self-effacement!’ [42]

But, Cunda, in the noble ones’ discipline, these are not called ‘self-effacement.’

In the noble ones’ discipline, these are called ‘peaceful abidings.’

¹¹² **Ākāsañāṅc’āyatana Pañha S** (S 40.5,4/4:265), SD 24.15. For scholastic details on the formless dhyanas, see Vism 10.

¹¹³ **Santā ete viharā ariyassa vinaye vuccanti**: this is the refrain for formless attainments [§§8-11]. Comy glosses *santā*, “peaceful” as referring to the mental objects (*arammaṇa*) as the factors which brings ease on account of being cooled (free from defilements) (*yasmā ca nesaṃ aṅgāni pi santāni ārammaṇābi pi, nibbutāni c’eva sukhāni cāti*, MA 1:186,21). These attainments are so called because they are profoundly peaceful (*santā*). The form dhyanas are described differently [§4n].

¹¹⁴ **Viññāṇāñc’āyatana Pañha S** (S 40.6,4/4:265), SD 24.16.

¹¹⁵ **Ākiñcaññ’āyatana Pañha S** (S 40.7,4/4:265), SD 24.17.

¹¹⁶ **N’eva,saññā,nāsaññā’āyatana Pañha S** (S 40.8,4/4:265), SD 24.18.

THE METHODS

1. Self-effacement (*sallekha*)

12 But here, Cunda, **self-effacement** should be cultivated by you, thus:¹¹⁷

12.2 THE 10 COURSES OF ACTION¹¹⁸

- | | |
|--|---|
| <p>(1) ‘Others may be <u>violent</u>;
here, we shall be non-violent.¹¹⁹
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.</p> | <p>Pare vihimsakā bhavissanti
mayam ettha avihimsakā bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo</p> |
| <p>(2) ‘Others may be <u>destroyers of life</u>;
here, we shall abstain from destroying life.¹²⁰
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.</p> | <p>Pare pāṇātipātī bhavissanti
mayam ettha pāṇātipātā paṭiviratā bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo</p> |
| <p>(3) ‘Others may be <u>takers of the not-given</u>;
here, we shall abstain from taking the not-given.¹²¹
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.</p> | <p>Pare adinn’ādāyī bhavissanti
mayam ettha adinn’ādānā paṭiviratā
bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo</p> |
| <p>(4) ‘Others may be <u>uncelibate</u>.¹²⁰
here, we shall be celibate.¹²¹
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.</p> | <p>Pare abrahmacārī bhavissanti
mayam ettha brahma,cārī bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo</p> |
| <p>(5) ‘Others may be <u>speakers of falsehood</u>;
here, we shall abstain from false speech.¹²¹
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.</p> | <p>Pare musā,vādī bhavissanti
mayam ettha musā,vādā paṭiviratā bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo</p> |

¹¹⁷ Comy: The Buddha, having answered Cunda’s question, now speaks of another type of over-estimator—those who attain the 8 attainments and believe that they are practising true self-effacement (*sallekha*) [2.1]. Though the 8 attainments are often an integral part of Dharma training—such as in **Nivāpa S** (M 25,12-19), SD 61.2; **Ariya Pariyesanā S** (M 26,34-42), SD 1.11—here they should not be called “self-effacement” because those who attain them does not use them as a basis for insight—as described in **Aṭṭhaka,nāgara S** (M 52), SD 41.2, and **Mahā Mālunkya,-putta S** (M 64), SD 21.10—but only as a means of enjoying comfort (*sukha*) and peace (*santa*). See §4 n on “not called ‘self-effacement’.”

¹¹⁸ This list of 10 courses of action is unique to this Sutta. It closely parallels the better known 10 unwholesome courses of action (*akusala kamma,patha*) and the 10 wholesome courses of action (*kusala kamma,patha*). In the 10 unwholesome courses of action, the 1st course deals with *pāṇātipāta*, “the taking of life,” the 3rd with *kāmesu micch’ācāra*, “sexual misconduct,” and the 10th with *micchā,diṭṭhi*, “wrong view.” Here, in **M 8**, the 1st is that of *vihimsaka*, “the violent,” the 4th *abrahma,cārī*, “the uncelibate,” and the 10th *vyāpanna,citta*, “the one with a mind of ill will.” In this arrangement, the 10th unwholesome course of action—*micchā,diṭṭhi*, “the one with wrong view,” forms no 11 of the M 8 list, which lists the tenfold rightness (*dasa sammatta*). On the unwholesome and wholesome courses of action, see **Mahā Kamma Vibhaṅga S** (M 136,8), SD 4.16. See n44 (§14, “The 10 courses of action” header).

¹¹⁹ “Non-violence” (*avihimsā*) is significantly placed first. The Subcomy (*ṭīkā*) says that it is a synonym for compassion (*karuṇā*), and is mentioned first because it is the root of all virtues (*sabba,guṇānaṃ mūla,bhāvato*), esp the root-cause of moral virtue (*sīlassa mūla,kāraṇaṃ*). (MAṬ:Be 13:292)

¹²⁰ Meaning, breaking the rule of celibacy despite taking the vow or training to be celibate. Broadly, this refers to “living a life that is by nature imperfect, inferior, vile” (*abrahmaṃ hīnaṃ lāmakaraṃ dhammaṃ carantīti abrahma,-cārī*, MA 1:188,2).

¹²¹ Here, celibacy (*brahma,cariya*) has 2 senses: (1) practising the highest, best way (spiritual life) (*brahmaṃ seṭṭhaṃ paṭipadaṃ paṭipajjatīri brahma,cārī*, MA 1:88,4); (2) a celibate life, abstaining from sexual intercourse (*methunā paṭiviratā*, MA 1:88,5). Dīgha Comy qu *Sallekha S* as an example of a sutta where *brahmaccāriya* is def as celibacy (*methuna,virati*) (DA 178).

- (6) 'Others may be slanderers;
here, we shall **abstain from slander.**'

Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (7) 'Others may be of harsh speech;
here, we shall **abstain from harsh speech.**'

Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (8) 'Others may be idle chatterers;
here, we shall **abstain from idle chatter.**'

Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (9) 'Others may be covetous;
here, we shall **not be covetous.**'
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (10) 'Others may be of a mind of ill will;
here, we shall be of **a mind free of ill will**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.

12.3 THE TENFOLD PATHS¹²²

- (11) 'Others may be of **wrong views**;
here, we shall be of **right view.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (12) 'Others may be of wrong intentions;
here, we shall be of **right intentions.**'
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (13) 'Others may be of wrong speech;
here, we shall be of **right speech.**'
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (14) 'Others may be of wrong action;
here, we shall be of **right action.**'
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (15) 'Others may be of wrong livelihood;
here, we shall be of **right livelihood.**'
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (16) 'Others may be of wrong effort;
here, we shall be of **right effort.**'
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (17) 'Others may be of wrong mindfulness;
here, we shall be of **right mindfulness.**'
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (18) 'Others may be of wrong concentration;
here, we shall be of **right concentration.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.

- Pare **pisuṇa, vācā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **pisuṇāya vācāya paṭiviratā**
bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **pharusa, vācā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **pharusāya vācāya paṭiviratā**
bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **samphappalāpī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **samphappalāpā paṭiviratā**
bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **abhijjhālū** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **anabhijjhālū** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **vyāpanna, cittā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **avyāpanna, cittā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo

- Pare **micchā, diṭṭhī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, diṭṭhī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **micchā, saṅkappā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, saṅkappā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **micchā, vācā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, vācā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **micchā, kammantā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, kammantā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **micchā, ājīvā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, ājīvā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **micchā, vāyāmā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, vāyāmā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **micchā, satī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, satī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **micchā, samādhi** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā, samādhi** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo

¹²² This is list of the tenfold wrongness (*dasa micchatta*) and their opposites. On the tenfold rightness (*dasa sammatta*), see SD 10.16 (1.8-10).

- (19) ‘Others may be of wrong knowledge;
here, we shall be of **right knowledge**.
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (20) ‘Others may be of wrong freedom [liberation];
here, we shall be of **right freedom**.
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (19) Pare **micchā,ñāṇī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammā,ñāṇī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- (20) Pare **micchā,vimuttī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **sammāvimuttī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- 12.4 THE 24 MENTAL STATES¹²³
- (21) ‘Others may be overcome by sloth and torpor,¹²⁴
here, we shall be **free of sloth and torpor**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (22) ‘Others may be restless;
here, we shall **not be restless**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (23) ‘Others may be doubtful;
here, we shall have **crossed over doubts**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (24) ‘Others may be angry;
here, we shall be **without anger**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (25) ‘Others may be grudging [resentful];¹²⁵
here, we shall **not be grudging**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (26) ‘Others may be scornful [contemptuous];¹²⁶
here, we shall **not be scornful**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (27) ‘Others may be spiteful [malicious];
here, we shall **not be spiteful**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (28) ‘Others may be jealous [envious];¹²⁷
here, we shall **not be jealous**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (29) ‘Others may be miserly;
here, we shall **not be miserly**.’
- Pare **thina,middha,pariyuṭṭhitā** bhavissanti,
mayam ettha **vigata,thina,middhā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **uddhatā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **anuddhatā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **vicikicchī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **tiṇṇa,vicikicchā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **kodhanā** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **akkodhanā** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **upanāhī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **anupanāhī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo [43]
- Pare **makkhī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **amakkhī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **paḷāsī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **apaḷāsī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **issukī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **anissukī** bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo
- Pare **maccharī** bhavissanti
mayam ettha **amaccharī** bhavissāmāti

¹²³ For nn on these 44 mental impurities, see [3], esp Table 3.2.2.

¹²⁴ Impurities (21)-(23)—sloth and torpor, restlessness and doubt—are part of the 5 mental hindrances [3.1.4]. The first 2 hindrances—sensual desire (*kāma-c, chanda*) and ill will (*vyāpāda*)—are not listed, says Comy, since they have been mentioned earlier as impurities (9)+(10), “covetous” (*abhjjhālu*) and “a mind of ill will” (*vyāpanna,citta*) (MA 1:189,13).

¹²⁵ *Upanāha*, “grudge, resentment,” ie, continuous and worsening anger (Vbh 891/357). It arises after we are repeatedly angry at someone or something (MA 1:169).

¹²⁶ *Makkha* (from √MRKṢ, “to smear”), derogatory conduct (Vbh 892/357) or devaluation of benefits others place on us (MA 1:169), often coupled with *paḷāsa*: M 1:15; A 1:95, 100, 299, 4:148, 456, 5:39, 156, 209, 310, 361; It 3; Sn 56, 437, 631, 1132; Dh 150, 407; J 5:141; Vbh 357, 380, 389; Pug 18, 22.

¹²⁷ *Issukī* = *issuka* (cf Skt *īṛṣu, īṛṣyu*; BHS *īṛṣuka*) + *-ī* suffix (Mogg 4:132). It means “being overwhelmed by jealousy” (*issukī hoti issābhībhūto*, V 5:197,30). Its sense overlaps with *iṣṣā*, which, however, has broader senses: “envy, jealousy; spite, resentment” (DPL). See “who is envious, whose envy is not abandoned” (*issukissa iṣṣā appahīnā hoti*) in *Cūḷa Assa,pura S* (M 40,3(7)/1:281,21), SD 41.8.

- Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.*
- (30) ‘Others may be fraudulent;¹²⁸
here, we shall **not be fraudulent.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (31) ‘Others may be deceitful;
here, we shall **not be deceitful.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (32) ‘Others may be callous [stubborn];¹²⁹
here, we shall **not be callous.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (33) ‘Others may be arrogant;
here, we shall **not be arrogant.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (34) ‘Others may be hard to speak to [to admonish];¹³⁰
here, we shall be **easy to speak to.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (35) ‘Others may be bad friends;¹³¹
here, we shall be **spiritual friends.**¹³²
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (36) ‘Others may be heedless;
here, we shall be **heedful** [diligent].
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (37) ‘Others may be faithless;
here, we shall be **faithful.**¹³³
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (38) ‘Others may be morally shameless;
here, we shall be **with moral shame.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (39) ‘Others may lack moral fear;
here we shall be **with moral fear.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (40) ‘Others may lack learning [have little listening];
here, we shall be of **much learning** [listen more].
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (41) ‘Others may be lazy;
here, we shall **exert effort.**
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- sallekho karaṇīyo*
*Pare **sathā** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **asathā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **māyāvī** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **amāyāvī** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **thaddhā** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **atthaddhā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **atimānī** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **anitimānī** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **dubbacā** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **suvacā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **papa,mittā** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **kalyāṇa,mittā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **pamattā** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **appamattā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **assaddhā** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **saddhā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **ahirikā** bhavissanti*
*Mayam ettha **hirimanā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **anottāpī** bhavissanti,*
*mayam ettha **ottāpī** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **appa-s,sutā** bhavissanti,*
*Mayam ettha **bahu-s,sutā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo
*Pare **kusitā** bhavissanti*
*mayam ettha **āraddha,vīriyā** bhavissāmāti*
sallekho karaṇīyo

¹²⁸ See Table 3.2.2 n on *sāṭha*.

¹²⁹ *Thaddha* (lit, “hard, rigid, firm”; fig. (a) “hardened, obdurate, callous, selfish” (D 1:118, 3:45; A 2:26 = It 113; Sn 104; J 1:88, 2:136); (b) “slow” (Miln 120); Past part of *thambheti*, “to make firm, prop, hold up.” See Table 3.2.2 n on *thambha*.

¹³⁰ “Hard to speak to” (*dubbacā*): see V 3:178 (V:H 1:310 n1). For Moggallāna’s instructions on “hard to admonish” and “easy to admonish,” see *Anumāna S* (M 15/1:95-99), SD 59.3.

¹³¹ Comy gives the example of Devadatta (MA 1:189,31).

¹³² Comy gives the example of the Buddha and others like Sāriputta (MA 1:189.32). It is possible here to render the sentence alternatively as “others may have bad friends, (but) here we have spiritual friends,” but the tr above at once identifies and confirms the audience as spiritual friends, and affirms their wholesome virtue.

¹³³ On these mental defilements, esp the set of 7 qualities—(37)-(43)—see [3]. See also MA 1:190.

- (42) ‘Others may be unmindful;
here, we shall be **established in mindfulness**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (43) ‘Others may lack wisdom;
here, we shall be **accomplished in wisdom**.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- (44) ‘Others may cling to self-views,
grasping them tenaciously,
have difficulty in giving them up,¹³⁴
here, we shall **not cling to self-views**,
not grasping them tenaciously,
easily giving them up.’
Thus, self-effacement should be cultivated.
- Pare muṭṭha-s,satī bhavissanti
mayam ettha upaṭṭhita-s,satī
sallekho karaṇīyo*
- Pare duppaññā bhavissanti,
mayam ettha paññā,sampannā bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo*
- Pare sandiṭṭhi,parāmāsī
ādhāna-g,gāhī
duppaṭinissaggī bhavissanti
mayam ettha asandiṭṭhi,parāmāsī
anādhāna-g,gāhī
suppaṭinissaggī bhavissāmāti
sallekho karaṇīyo*

2. The arising of thoughts (*citt’uppāda*)¹³⁵

THE 3 DOORS

13 Cunda, even **the arising of thoughts in wholesome states** is of great benefit, I say! What more of should be said of verbal and bodily actions done in conformity with it.¹³⁶ Therefore, Cunda:

13.2 [THE 10 COURSES OF ACTION]

- (1) The thought [mind] should be made to arise thus:
‘Others may be violent;
here, we shall be **non-violent**.’¹³⁷
- (2) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be destroyers of life;
here, we shall **not be destroyers of life**.’
- (3) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be takers of the not-given;
here, we shall **abstain from taking the not-given**.’
- (4) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be uncelibate;
here, we shall be **celibate**.’
- (5) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may speak falsehood;
here, we shall **abstain from false speech**.’
- (6) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may slander;
here, we shall **abstain from slander**.’
- (7) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may use harsh speech;
here, we shall **abstain from harsh speech**.’
- (8) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may indulge in idle chatter;
here, we shall **abstain from idle chatter**.’

¹³⁴ Comy: This describes those who stubbornly hold on to a view that has arisen to them, thinking, “This alone is the truth!” They do not give it up even when the Buddha speaks to them with reason (MA 1:190). As at **Udumbarikā Sīha,nāda S** (D 25,15(22)/3:48), SD 1.4; **Saṅgīti S** (D 33,2.2.(15)/3:246 f); **Anumāna S** (M 15,3/1:96) SD 59.3, **Sāma,-gāma S** (M 104,11/2:246), SD 62.4; **Vivāda,mūla S** (A 6.36/3:335), SD 47.14, **(Dasaka) Nigaṇṭha S** (A 10.78/5:150). SD 65.19; **Cv 4.14.3** (V 2:89) 6 roots of quarrels.

¹³⁵ On the translation of *bhavissāmi* in §§13-14, see (1.1.3.8).

¹³⁶ *Ko pana vādo kāyena vācāya anuvidhīyanāsu*. Comy: **The arising of (wholesome) thoughts** is of great benefit because it entails only good and happiness, and because it is the cause of subsequent actions that conform to it. (MA 1:191)

¹³⁷ *Pare vihiṃsakā bhavissanti, mayam ettha avihiṃsakā bhāvissāmāti cittam uppādetabbarāṃ*.

- (9) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be covetous;
here, we shall **not be covetous.**’
- (10) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have a mind of ill will;
here, we shall have a **mind free of ill will.**’
- 13.3 THE TENFOLD PATHS
- (11) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have wrong views;
here, we shall be of **right view.**’
- (12) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have wrong intention;
here, we shall be of **right intention.**’
- (13) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may use wrong speech;
here, we shall be of **right speech.**’
- (14) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be of wrong action;
here, we shall be of **right action.**’
- (15) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be of wrong livelihood;
here, we shall be of **right livelihood.**’
- (16) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may make wrong effort;
here, we shall be of **right effort.**’
- (17) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have wrong mindfulness;
here, we shall be of **right mindfulness.**’
- (18) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have wrong concentration;
here, we shall be of **right concentration.**’
- (19) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have wrong knowledge;
here, we shall be of **right knowledge.**’
- (20) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have wrong freedom [liberation];
here, we shall be of **right freedom.**’

13.4 THE 23 MENTAL STATES

- (21) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be overcome by sloth and torpor;
here, we shall be **free from sloth and torpor.**’
- (22) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be restless;
here, we shall **not be restless.**’
- (23) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have doubts;
here, we shall have **crossed over doubts.**’
- (24) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may have anger;
here, we shall be **without anger.**’
- (25) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be grudging [resentful],¹³⁸
here, we shall **not be grudging.**’
- (26) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be scornful [contemptuous];
here, we shall **not be scornful.**’
- (27) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be spiteful [malicious];
here, we shall **not be spiteful.**’
- (28) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be jealous [envious],¹³⁹
here, we shall **not be jealous.**’

¹³⁸ *Upanāha*, “grudge, resentment” ie, continuous and worsening anger (Vbh 891/357). It arises after we are repeatedly angry at someone or something (MA 1:169).

- (29) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be miserly;
here, we shall **not be miserly.**’
- (30) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be fraudulent;
here, we shall **not be fraudulent.**’
- (31) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be deceitful;
here, we shall **not be deceitful.**’
- (32) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be callous [stubborn];
here, we shall **not be callous.**’
- (33) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be arrogant;
here, we shall **not be arrogant.**’
- (34) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be hard to speak to;
here, we shall be **easy to speak to.**’
- (35) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be bad friends;
here, we shall be **spiritual friends.**¹⁴⁰
- (36) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be heedless;
here, we shall be **heedful** [diligent].
- (37) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may lack faith;
here, we shall be **faithful.**
- (38) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be morally shameless;
here, we shall **have moral shame.**
- (39) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may lack moral fear;
here we shall **have moral fear.**
- (40) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may lack learning [have little listening];
here, we shall be of **much learning** [listen more].
- (41) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be lazy;
here; we shall **exert effort.**
- (42) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may be unmindful;
here, we shall be **established in mindfulness.**
- (43) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may lack wisdom;
here, we shall be **accomplished in wisdom.**
- (44) *The thought should be made to arise thus:*
‘Others may cling to self-views,
have difficulty in giving them up;
not grasping them tenaciously,
grasping them tenaciously,
here, we shall **not cling to self-views**,
easily giving them up.’

3. Moving around and beyond (*parikkamana*)

THE PARABLES OF THE PATH AND THE FORD

14 Suppose, Cunda, there were an uneven path but there is another path that is even for moving around and beyond that,¹⁴¹

¹³⁹ *Issukī* = *issuka* (cf Skt *īṣṣu*, *īṣṣyū*; BHS *īṣṣuka*) + *-ī* suffix (Mogg 4:132). It means “being overwhelmed by jealousy” (*issukī hoti issābhibhūto*, V 5:197,30). *Issā*, however, has broader senses: “envy, jealousy; spite, resentment” (DPL). See “who is envious, whose envy is not abandoned” (*issukissa issā appahīnā hoti*) in **Cūḷa Assa, pura S** (M 40,3(7)/-1:281,21), SD 41.8.

¹⁴⁰ It is possible here to render the sentence alternatively as “others may have bad friends, (but) here we have spiritual friends,” but the tr above at once identifies and confirms the audience as spiritual friends, and affirms their wholesome virtue.

or, suppose that there were an uneven ford but there is **another ford that is even** for moving around and beyond that— [44]
even so, Cunda,

14.2 THE 10 COURSES OF ACTION¹⁴²

- | | |
|--|---|
| (1) For the person who is <u>violent</u> , | non-violence is for moving around and beyond it. ¹⁴³ |
| (2) For the person who is <u>a destroyer of life</u> , | the abstention from killing is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (3) For the person who <u>takes the not-given</u> , | the abstention from taking the not-given is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (4) For the person who is <u>uncelibate</u> , | abstention from incelibacy is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (5) For the person who <u>speaks falsehood</u> , | the abstention from false speech is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (6) For the person who <u>slanders</u> , | the abstention from slander is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (7) For the person who speaks <u>harsh speech</u> , | the abstention from harsh speech is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (8) For the person who indulges in <u>idle chatter</u> , | the abstention from idle chatter is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (9) For the person who is <u>covetous</u> , | non-covetousness is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (10) For the person <u>with a mind of ill will</u> , | non-ill will is for moving around and beyond it. ¹⁴⁴ |

14.3 THE TENFOLD PATHS

- | | |
|---|--|
| (11) For the person <u>with wrong views</u> , | right view is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (12) For the person <u>with wrong intention</u> , | right intention is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (13) For the person <u>with wrong speech</u> , | right speech is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (14) For the person <u>with wrong action</u> , | right action is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (15) For the person <u>with wrong livelihood</u> , | right livelihood is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (16) For the person <u>with wrong effort</u> , | right effort is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (17) For the person <u>with wrong mindfulness</u> , | right mindfulness is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (18) For the person <u>with wrong concentration</u> , | right concentration is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (19) For the person <u>with wrong knowledge</u> , | right knowledge is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (20) For the person <u>with wrong freedom</u> , | right freedom is for moving around and beyond it. |

14.4 THE 24 MENTAL STATES

- | | |
|---|---|
| (21) For the person <u>overcome by sloth and torpor</u> , | there is the freedom from sloth and torpor is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (22) For the person who is <u>restless</u> , | non-restlessness is for moving around and beyond it. |
| (23) For the person who <u>has doubts</u> , | crossing over doubts is for moving around and beyond it. |

¹⁴¹ *Seyyathā'pi cunda visamo maggo assa, tassa añño samo maggo parikkamanāya.* On the meaning and translation of **parikkamana** [2.3.3.3].

¹⁴² This whole section has a close parallel in **Parikkamana S** (A 10.175) [2.3].

¹⁴³ *Vihimsakassa purisa, puggalassa avihimsā hoti parikkamanāya.*

¹⁴⁴ *Avyāpādo hoti parikkamanāya.*

- (24) For the person who has anger; **non-anger** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (25) For the person who is grudging [resentful], **non-grudging** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (26) For the person who is scornful [contemptuous], **non-scorning** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (27) For the person who is spiteful [malicious], **non-spitefulness** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (28) For the person who is jealous [envious], **non-jealousy** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (29) For the person who is miserly, **non-miserliness** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (30) For the person who is fraudulent, **non-fraudulence** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (31) For the person who is deceitful, **non-deceitfulness** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (32) For the person who is callous [stubborn], **non-callousness** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (33) For the person who is arrogant, **non-arrogance** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (34) For the person who is hard to speak to, **being easy to speak to** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (35) For the person who is a bad friend, **spiritual friendship** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (36) For the person who is heedless, **heedfulness** [diligence] is for moving around and beyond it.
- (37) For the person who lacks faith, **faith** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (38) For the person who is morally shameless, **moral shame** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (39) For the person who lacks moral fear, **moral fear** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (40) For the person who lacks learning, **much learning** [listening] is for moving around and beyond it.
- (41) For the person who is lazy, **the exertion of effort** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (42) For the person who is unmindful, **the establishment of mindfulness** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (43) For the person who lacks wisdom, **the accomplishment of wisdom** is for moving around and beyond it.
- (44) For the person who clings to self-views, and has difficulty in giving them up—
not grasping them tenaciously, **grasping them tenaciously**,
the non-clinging to self-views, easily giving them up: *this is for moving around and beyond it.*

THE BENEFITS

4. The upward states (*upari, bhāva*)

THE 2 KINDS OF STATES

15 Cunda, just as all unwholesome states **lead one to downward states**, just as wholesome states **lead one to upward states**,¹⁴⁵ even so, Cunda:

¹⁴⁵ Ee Se: *Seyyathā'pi cunda ye keci akusalā dhammā sabbe te adho, bhāvaṅ, gamanīyā [Be *adho, bhāgaṅ*-], ye keci kusalā dhammā sabbe te upari, bhāvaṅ, gamanīyā [Be *adho, bhāgaṅ*-]. Be with *-bhāgaṅ*- are prob wr: they only appear in comys, referring to body-parts (VA 257,23), a building (DhA 4:92.6 = J 2:176,17), the hell-state (DhsA 387,19), or the Ganges (J 4:230,28) or a place (J 4:232,20). Both these words only appear here (hapax legomena). See [1.1.3.6-1.1.3.7].*

15.2 THE 10 COURSES OF ACTION

- (1) For the person who is violent,
- (2) For the person who is a destroyer of life,
- (3) For the person who is take the not-given,
- (4) For the person who is uncelibate,
- (5) For the person who speaks falsehood,
- (6) For the person who slanders,
- (7) For the person who speaks harsh speech,
- (8) For the person who indulges in idle chatter,
- (9) For the person who is covetous,
- (10) For the person with a mind of ill will,

non-violence leads to an upward state.¹⁴⁶
the abstention from killing leads to an upward state.
the abstention from taking the not-given leads to an upward state.
abstention from incelibacy leads to an upward state.
the abstention from false speech leads to an upward state.
the abstention from slander leads to an upward state.
the abstention from harsh speech leads to an upward state.
the abstention from idle chatter leads to an upward state.
non-covetousness leads to an upward state.
non-ill will leads to an upward state.

15.3 [THE TENFOLD RIGHTNESS]

- (11) For the person with wrong views,
- (12) For the person with wrong intention,
- (13) For the person with wrong speech,
- (14) For the person with wrong action,
- (15) For the person with wrong livelihood,
- (16) For the person with wrong effort,
- (17) For the person with wrong mindfulness,
- (18) For the person with wrong concentration,
- (19) For the person with wrong knowledge,
- (20) For the person with wrong freedom,

right view leads to an upward state.
right intention leads to an upward state.
right speech leads to an upward state.
right action leads to an upward state.
right livelihood leads to an upward state.
right effort leads to an upward state.
right mindfulness leads to an upward state.
right concentration leads to an upward state.
right knowledge leads to an upward state.
right freedom leads to an upward state.

15.4 THE 24 MENTAL STATES

- (21) For the person overcome by sloth and torpor,
- (22) For the person who is restless,
- (23) For the person who has doubts,
- (24) For the person who has anger,
- (25) For the person who is grudging [resentful],
- (26) For the person who is scornful [contemptuous],
- (27) For the person who is spiteful [malicious],
- (28) For the person who is jealous [envious],
- (29) For the person who is miserly,
- (30) For the person who is fraudulent,
- (31) For the person who is deceitful,
- (32) For the person who is callous [stubborn],
- (33) For the person who is arrogant,
- (34) For the person who is hard to speak to,
- (35) For the person who is a bad friend,

the freedom from sloth and torpor leads to an upward state.
non-restlessness leads to an upward state.
the crossing over doubts leads to an upward state.
non-anger leads to an upward state.
non-grudging leads to an upward state.
non-scorning leads to an upward state.
non-spitefulness leads to an upward state.
non-jealousy leads to an upward state.
non-miserliness leads to an upward state.
non-fraudulence leads to an upward state.
non-deceitfulness leads to an upward state.
non-callousness leads to an upward state.
non-arrogance leads to an upward state.
being easy to speak to leads to an upward state.
spiritual friendship leads to an upward state.

¹⁴⁶ *Vihimsakassa purisa, puggalassa avihimsā hoti upari, bhāvāya.*

- | | |
|--|--|
| (36) For the person who <u>is heedless</u> , | heedfulness [diligence] <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (37) For the person who <u>lacks faith</u> , | faith <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (38) For the person who <u>is morally shameless</u> , | moral shame <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (39) For the person who <u>lacks moral fear</u> , | moral fear <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (40) For the person who <u>lacks learning</u> , | much learning [listening] <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (41) For the person who <u>is lazy</u> , | the exertion of effort <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (42) For the person who <u>is unmindful</u> , | the establishment of mindfulness <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (43) For the person who <u>lacks wisdom</u> , | the accomplishment of wisdom <i>leads to an upward state.</i> |
| (44) For the person who <u>clings to self-views</u> ,
and has difficulty in giving them up—
not grasping them tenaciously, | grasping them tenaciously,
[45] the non-clinging to self-views ,
easily giving them up— <i>this leads to an upward state.</i> |

5. The way to nirvana (*parinibbāna*)

THE MUD PARABLES

16 Surely, Cunda, it is impossible that **one who is sunk into the mud** would be able to pull out another who is sunk into mud, too.¹⁴⁷

Surely, Cunda, it is possible that one who is not sunk into the mud will be able to pull out *another who is sunk into the mud*.

16.2 Surely, Cunda, it is impossible that one who is **untamed, untrained, not attained to nirvana**,¹⁴⁸ would tame, train or be able to help another to attain nirvana.

Surely, Cunda, it is possible that one who is tamed, trained, attained to nirvana, will tame, train or be able to help another to attain nirvana.¹⁴⁹

Even so, Cunda:

16.3 THE 10 COURSES OF ACTION

- | | |
|--|---|
| (1) For the person who is <u>violent</u> , | non-violence is the means of utter quenching. ¹⁵⁰ |
| (2) For the person who is a <u>destroyer of life</u> , | the abstention from killing <i>is the means of utter quenching.</i> |
| (3) For the person who <u>takes the not-given</u> , | the abstention from taking the not-given <i>is the means of utter quenching.</i> |
| (4) For the person who is <u>uncelibate</u> , | abstention from incelibacy <i>is the means of utter quenching.</i> |
| (5) For the person who <u>speaks falsehood</u> , | the abstention from false speech <i>is the means of utter quenching.</i> |

¹⁴⁷ *So vata cunda attanā palipapalipanno param palipapalipannam uddharissatīti netaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati.*

¹⁴⁸ “Not attained to nirvana,” *aparinibbuto*: see A 1:194.

¹⁴⁹ *So vata cunda attanā danto vinīto parinibbuto param damessati viñessati parinibbāpessatīti ṭhānam etaṃ vijjati.* On *parinibbāna* and its key forms, see [1.1.3.9].

¹⁵⁰ *Vihimsakassa purisa, puggalassa avihimsā hoti parinibbānāya*, lit “For the person who is violent, there is non-violence by which it is quenched.” Comy tells us that this sentence can be read in any of two ways: (1) the one who is non-violent [free from violence] can use his non-violence to help remove the violence in another, and (2) the one who is violent can cultivate non-violence to remove his own violence. The rest of occasions of mental impurities should be treated in the same twofold process. (MA 1:194)

- (6) For the person who slanders,
 (7) For the person who speaks harsh speech,
 (8) For the person who indulges in idle chatter,
 (9) For the person who is covetous,
 (10) For the person with a mind of ill will,

the abstention from slander is the means of utter quenching.
the abstention from harsh speech is the means of utter quenching.
the abstention from idle chatter is the means of utter quenching.
non-covetousness is the means of utter quenching.
non-ill will is the means of utter quenching.

16.4 THE TENFOLD PATHS

- (11) For the person with wrong views,
 (12) For the person with wrong intention,
 (13) For the person with wrong speech,
 (14) For the person with wrong action,
 (15) For the person with wrong livelihood,
 (16) For the person with wrong effort,
 (17) For the person with wrong mindfulness,
 (18) For the person with wrong concentration,
 (19) For the person with wrong knowledge,
 (20) For the person with wrong freedom,

right view is the means of utter quenching.
right intention is the means of utter quenching.
right speech is the means of utter quenching.
right action is the means of utter quenching.
right livelihood is the means of utter quenching.
right effort is the means of utter quenching.
right mindfulness is the means of utter quenching.
right concentration is the means of utter quenching.
right knowledge is the means of utter quenching.
right freedom is the means of utter quenching.

16.5 THE 24 MENTAL STATES

- (21) For the person overcome by sloth and torpor,
 (22) For the person who is restless,
 (23) For the person who has doubts,
 (24) For the person who has anger,
 (25) For the person who is grudging [resentful],
 (26) For the person who is scornful [contemptuous],
 (27) For the person who is spiteful [malicious],
 (28) For the person who is jealous [envious],
 (29) For the person who is miserly,
 (30) For the person who is fraudulent,
 (31) For the person who is deceitful,
 (32) For the person who is callous [stubborn],¹⁵¹
 (33) For the person who is arrogant,
 (34) For the person who is hard to speak to,
 (35) For the person who is a bad friend,
 (36) For the person who is heedless,
 (37) For the person who lacks faith,
 (38) For the person who is morally shameless,
 (39) For the person who lacks moral fear,

the freedom from sloth and torpor is the means of utter quenching.
non-restlessness is the means of utter quenching.
the crossing over doubts is the means of utter quenching.
non-anger is the means of utter quenching.
non-grudging is the means of utter quenching.
non-scorning is the means of utter quenching.
non-spitefulness is the means of utter quenching.
non-jealousy is the means of utter quenching.
non-miserliness is the means of utter quenching.
non-fraudulence is the means of utter quenching.
non-deceitfulness is the means of utter quenching.
non-callousness is the means of utter quenching.
non-arrogance is the means of utter quenching.
being easy to speak to is the means of utter quenching.
spiritual friendship is the means of utter quenching.
heedfulness [diligence] is the means of utter quenching.
faith is the means of utter quenching.
moral shame is the means of utter quenching.
moral fear is the means of utter quenching.

¹⁵¹ *Thaddha* (lit, “hard, rigid, firm”; fig, (a) “hardened, obdurate, callous, selfish” (D 1:118, 3:45; A 2:26 = It 113; Sn 104; J 1:88, 2:136); (b) “slow” (Miln 120); Past part of *thambheta*, “to make firm, prop, hold up.”

- (40) For the person who lacks learning, **much learning** [listening] *is the means of utter quenching.*
- (41) For the person who is lazy, **the exertion of effort** *is the means of utter quenching.*
- (42) For the person who is unmindful, **the establishment of mindfulness** *is the means of utter quenching.*
- (43) For the person who lacks wisdom, **the accomplishment of wisdom** *is the means of utter quenching.*
- (44) For the person who clings to self-views, and has difficulty in giving them up— not grasping them tenaciously, grasping them tenaciously, **the non-clinging to self-views**, easily giving them up: *this is the means of [46] utter quenching.*

Conclusion (with exhortation)

17 Thus, Cunda, the exposition on self-effacement	(<i>sallekha,pariyāya</i>)	has been shown by me;	[§12]
the exposition on the arising of thought	(<i>citt'uppāda,pariyāya</i>)	has been shown by me;	[§13]
the exposition on the action to be taken	(<i>parikkamana,pariyāya</i>)	has been shown by me;	[§14]
the exposition on the upward state	(<i>upari,bhāva,pariyāya</i>)	has been shown by me;	[§15]
the exposition on utter quenching	(<i>parinibbāna,pariyāya</i>)	has been shown by me.	[§16]

18 Cunda, whatever a teacher should do out of compassion for the good of disciples, for the sake of their welfare, this has been done to you by me.¹⁵²

These, Cunda, are the foot of trees;¹⁵³ these are empty abodes.¹⁵⁴

Meditate,¹⁵⁵ Cunda! Be not heedless! Regret not later!

This is our instruction to you.¹⁵⁶

19 The Blessed said this. Satisfied, the venerable Mahā Cunda rejoiced in the Blessed One's word.

— evaṃ —

170606 170715 170828

¹⁵² Comy: The task of a compassionate teacher is to teach the Dharma rightly; then, it is the pupil's task to practise the Dharma so that he awakens. (MA 1:195)

¹⁵³ "These are the foot of trees," *etāni rukkha,mūlāni*. "Foot" (adv) here is singular, like "bottom."

¹⁵⁴ Sometimes rendered as "empty place".

¹⁵⁵ "Meditate!" *jhāyatha*, lit "cultivate *jhāna*" (M 1:45, 118; S 4:133, 4:359, 361, 362, 368, 373; A 3:87, 89, 4:139, 392). Syn *bhāvettha* (2nd pl), "cultivate!" See **Buddha Discovers Dhyana**, SD 33.1b (3.3.2).

¹⁵⁶ This is stock: **Sallekha S** (M 8,18/1:46), SD 51.8; **Dvedhā,vitakka S** (M 19,27/1:118), SD 61.1; **Āneñja,sappāya S** (M 106,15/2:266 f), SD 85.13; **Indriya,bhāvanā S** (M 152,18/3:302), SD 17.13; (**Nava Purāṇa**) **Kamma S** (S 35.146/-4:133), SD 4.12; **Kāya S** (S 43.1/4:359), SD 12.21(1); & all suttas in the same **Asāṅkhata Saṃyutta** (S 43.2-44/4:360-373); **Bhikkhuṇ'upassaya S** (S 47.10/5:157), SD 24.2; **Dhamma,vihārī S 1** (A 5.73/3:87), SD 44.4; **Dhamma,vihārī S 2** (A 5.74/3:89), SD 44.5; **Araka S** (A 7.70,4/4:139), SD 16.17; cf **Mahā Palobhana J** (J 507). The sentence "**regret not later**" (*mā pacchā vippaṭisārino ahuvattha*), in the second para, also occurs at **Mahā,parinibbāna S** (D 16,5.19+20/2:147, 16,6.5/2:155 ×3, the Buddha's last words) = **Kusinārā S** (A 4.76/2:79 f); **Devatā S** (A 9.19/4:392), SD 57.14; cf **Mahā Palobhana J** (J 507). For comy, see MA 1:195 f; SA 3:111 f, 266 f.